

COMHAIRLE CONTAE AN CHLÁIR CLARE COUNTY COUNCIL



Quality Assurance Report for 2023

Submitted to the National Oversight Audit Commission (NOAC) in compliance with the Public Spending Code

May 2024

•		



COMHAIRLE CONTAE AN CHLÁIR CLARE COUNTY COUNCIL

Quality Assurance Report for 2023

issued by

Clare County Council

Submitted to the National Oversight Audit
Commission (NOAC) in compliance with
the Public Spending Code

Certification

j

This quality assurance report is for the year 2023 and meets the requirements of the Public Spending Code. The report reflects Clare County Council's assessment of compliance with the Public Spending Code. It is based on financial, organisational and performance related information from across the Council's various areas of responsibility.

Signature of Chief Executive

Dated: May 2024

Contents

Details	Page No.
1. Introduction	2
2. Inventory of projects & programmes	3
3. Published summary of procurements > €10m.	6
4. Assessment of compliance	6
5. Summary of in-depth checks	7
6. Conclusion	8
Appendix A: Checklists 1 to 7	10
Appendix B: In-depth reviews	18
Appendix C: Inventories of projects & programmes above €0.5m	40

Introduction

The primary aim of the Public Spending Code (PSC)Quality Assurance process is to gauge the extent to which the Council is meeting the obligations outlined in the Code. The Council is a 'sponsoring agency' under the Code, having primary responsibility for evaluating, planning and managing public investment within the parameters of the Code.

Details of the PSC are set out in A Guide to Evaluating, Planning and Managing Public found on the website December 2019 and can be Investment. http://publicspendingcode.per.gov.ie. The Code was revised in certain respects in 2019 and the revisions came into effect in January 2020. The code as it applies to capital project appraisals was further updated in 2024 effective going forward. The code comprises a suite of guidance documents which sets out six stages in the lifecycle of a project: strategic assessment, preliminary business case, final business case including design, procurement strategy and tendering, implementation, review and ex-post evaluation The PSC was written with Government Departments in mind, but there is sectoral guidance¹ agreed between DPER and the Local Government sector and this report has been compiled in line with that sectoral guidance.

Clare County Council has completed this year's Quality Assurance (QA) report as part of its ongoing compliance with the PSC which reports on the five steps as outlined below This indepth review had found that the council is broadly compliant with the code.

The Quality Assurance Process contains five steps:

- Draw up inventories (lists) of all projects/programmes at different stages of the project life cycle in the subject reporting year which have a total project life cost in excess of €0.5m.
- 2. Publish summary information on the Council website of all single procurements in excess of €10m that occurred in the year.
- 3. Complete seven checklists provided in the PSC Quality Assurance document.
- **4.** Carry out a more in-depth check on a small number of selected projects/programmes. The check must represent a minimum of 5% of capital and 1% of current expenditure over a rolling three-year period.
- 5. Complete a short report for the National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC)

which arises from the completion of the prior steps as outlined. This report satisfies this step for Clare County Council for 2023.

Step 1 - Inventory of Projects/Programmes

The 2023 inventory is summarised below, by numbers of projects and by value. Detailed Inventory list of all expenditure which exceeds €0.5m, at each of the three stages of the project life cycle are set out in Appendix C. It captures both revenue and capital expenditure and over the lifecycle:

- being considered;
- being incurred;
- · recently completed.

	Current expenditure	Capital expenditure	
Project numbers			Totals
Expenditure being considered	12	24	36
Expenditure being incurred	26	43	69
Expenditure discontinued	0	13	13
Totals	38	80	118

	Current expenditure €	Capital expenditure €	€	
Project total values			Totals	
Expenditure being considered	31,016,662.00	73,781,861.00	104,798,523.00	
Expenditure being incurred	42,051,555.00	313,289,321.65	355,340,876.65	
Expenditure completed or discontinued	0	17,817,837.53	17,817,837.53	
Totals	73,068,217.00	404,889,020.18	477,957,237.18	

A note on current expenditure being considered.

In accordance with the code, if a current budget increase between 2023 and 2024 exceeds €0.5m, the increase is reported as expenditure being considered. The value of such increases in this report is €31,016,662 comprising twelve items.

• €1,439,011 increase on Housing maintenance, Estate Maintenance and Management and returning Vacant Housing Stock to use (A01)

- €946,327 increase for the Operation of the Homeless Service (A05)
- €1,169,468 increase on RAS and Leasing Programme (A07)
- €3,742,587 increase in Housing grants Housing Aid to Older People, Housing Adaptation Grants and Mobility Aid Grants (A09)
- €712,751 increase for Maintenance and Improvement of Regional Roads (B03)
- €536,275 increase for Local Road Maintenance and Improvement (B04)
- €569,342 increase for Administration of Group and Private Installations (C05)
- €13,465,706 increase for Tourism Development and Promotion arising from the takeover of the Shannon Heritage Clare sites.(D05)
- €1,802,674 increase for Community and Enterprise Function arising from the Ukrainian and International Protection remit of Local Authorities(D06)
- €4,813,760 increase for Economic Development and Promotion arising from the inclusion if the Department of Enterprise Increased Cost of business Grant 2024. (D09)
- €1,318,691 increase for Operation of Fire Service from the implementation of an increased pay agreement. (E11)
- €500,070 increase for Outdoor Leisure Areas Operations (F03)

Housing Estate Maintenance and Management

 Three Tenancy Enforcement Officers appointed with flexible working hours to manage and mitigate against complaints of anti-social behaviour.
 Returning Vacant Housing Stock to use - Upgrading of properties as part of the Energy Efficiency Retrofit programme that sets targets to upgrade Local Authority Housing Stock to a B2/cost optimal BER.

Homeless

 A new Service level agreement is provided for in 2024 for the acquisition of a new Homeless Hub. In addition, approval has been received for new FOCUS staff before end of year.

RAS (Rental Accommodation Scheme) and Leasing

• Budgets have increased due to the rise in the number of Approved Housing Body properties which were provided (including Mortgage to Rent).

Housing Grants

 The demand for private house grants continues to be strong and exceeds available resources year on year. Inflation and general rising construction costs are adding extra pressures to the grants process as applicants struggle to deal with additional costs incurred over the grants support provided.

Regional and Local Roads - Maintenance and Improvement

• It is necessary to put a plan and fund in place to deliver the services traditionally carried out by (former) Water Services staff in maintaining and managing the flood risk associated with the surface water network.

Administration of Group Water Schemes and Private Installations

Increased in Grant applicants for the Group Water schemes subsidies.

Tourism Development and Promotion

 Integration of Shannon Heritage Tourism sites into the Council's portfolio at Bunratty Castle and Folk park, Knappogue, Craggaunowen and the Gift Shop at the Cliffs of Moher.

Community and Enterprise Function

- Implementation of the Increased Cost of Business Scheme (ICOB), which is a grant to benefit small and medium businesses
- Continuation of Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) Scheme commercial rate grant scheme plus retention of Hospitality Grant Scheme

Economic Development and Promotion

 An increased focus on derelict sites will continue in 2024 with an additional budget provision for Vacant and Derelict Property Grants

Operation of Fire Service

Payments to other fire authorities increase, energy increases, Salaries,
 Communications Code and Training

Outdoor Leisure Areas Operations

Street Cleaning and Public Realm Maintenance at amenity and beach locations.

Step 2 - Summary of Single Procurements in excess of €10m

The PSC Quality Assurance process requires all councils to publish all individual procurements in excess of €10m on their website. In 2023, in Clare County Council there was no procurement in excess of €10m. In accordance with the requirement under the PSC to publish such procurements, the following is the location for the publication on the Council's website https://www.clarecoco.ie/services/business/procurement.

Step 3 - Assessment of Compliance

The third step in the quality assurance process involves completing a set of checklists covering all expenditure. There are seven checklists in total, and in all, 82 questions are asked, aligned to the expenditure inventory/expenditure type, as tabulated below:

Checklists to be completed aligned with inventory				
Expenditure type	Checklist that applies			
	Checklist 1 for General obligations, not specific to individual expenditure items			
Expenditure being considered	Checklist 2 for Capital projects or capital grant schemes being considered Checklist 3 for Current expenditure being considered			
Expenditure being	Checklist 4 for Capital expenditure being incurred			
incurred	Checklist 5 for Current expenditure being Incurred			
Expenditure	Checklist 6 for Capital expenditure completed			
discontinued	Checklist 7 for Current expenditure completed			

Compliance with the questions on each checklist is done by rating the compliance level, where a rating 1 signifies 'scope for significant improvement', 2 signifies 'compliant but with some improvement necessary', and 3 signifies 'broadly compliant'. One scored set of checklists representing the Council overall was compiled from multiple sample contributions from across the organisation. The compiled checklists are set out in Appendix A.

Compliance assessment from Checklist Assessments

Across checklists 1 to 6, Clare County Council is broadly compliant.

Considerable liaison with and oversight by Approving Authorities applies to capital projects, upon which funding drawdown relies. Checklist 7 concerns current expenditure discontinued.

Step 4 - In-Depth Checks

The PSC quality assurance requires this Council to carry out an in-depth check of projects amounting to a minimum 5% per annum for capital expenditure over a rolling three-year period, and 1% per annum for current expenditure, similarly. The report for 2023 marks the second year of a rolling three years (2022-2024) for the purposes of the in-depth quality assurance check. One capital project and one current programme were subject to an in-depth check for this report. The Internal Audit unit of the Council was tasked with carrying out this step.

Required: in-depth check must average 5% per annum for capital expenditure over 3 years. 2023 is year 2.

Required: in-depth check must average 1% per annum for current expenditure over 3 years. 2023 is year 2.

	Current - total on inventory in the year	value of project or programme reviewed in depth	% in depth reviewed in the year	Stage of expenditure in- depth checked
2022	€95,405,352.00	€2,324,065.00	2.43%	current being incurred
2023	€73,068,217.00	€3,397,916.00	4.7%	current being incurred
2024				
		total average % checked		
		average % over the three years	2023 is year 2	
	Capital - total on inventory in the year	value of project or programme reviewed in depth	% in depth reviewed in the year	
2022	€347,017,437.00	€13,663,623.00	3.93%	capital being incurred, and capital being completed
2023	€404,899,020.18	€86,972,114.00	21.5%	capital being incurred,
2024				
		total average % checked		
		average % over the		
		three years	2023 is year 2	

5 In-Depth Checks - Summary

The in-depth checks were completed on a Capital Expenditure of Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and the R494 Improvement Scheme and a Current Expenditure on the Administration of Homeless Service. Appendix B of this report sets out more detail.

5.1 - Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and the R494 Improvement Scheme-Incurring

The Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement Scheme were proposed by Clare County Council and North Tipperary County Council. Its primary aim is to provide appropriate road infrastructure in the towns of Killaloe and Ballina, which face challenges due to heavy traffic, endangering their historical character and community infrastructure.

The scheme is designed to accommodate the anticipated local, regional and national development in this area.

5.2 - Administration of Homeless Service. - Incurring

The administration of Homeless Services is managed by the Housing Section of Clare County Council. The total expenditure for the service in 2023 was €3,397,916.

Clare County Council face significant challenges in dealing with individuals and families presenting as homeless. The lack of affordable rental properties and increasing rents are resulting in people finding themselves in a homeless situation. Most cases presenting themselves as homeless are also further complicated due to issues such as mental health, addictions, anti-social behavior, and family breakdown.

Clare County Council is included in the Mid-West Homeless Action Team which provides a coordinated, inter agency response to the support needs and case management of homeless people and individuals at the risk of homeless. Clare County Council submit quarterly homelessness expenditure returns to Limerick City & County Council who administer the allocated Departmental funding for the homelessness services for the region. Direct service expenditure is 90% Section 10 funded, with the balance borne by the Clare County Council as part of its annual budget allocations. The total Section 10 income in 2023 was €2.7m, with a net cost of €0.7million.

Clare County Council has entered into Service Level Agreements with a number of Service Providers who provide supports in emergency and long-term accommodation, along with Tenancy Sustainment Supports..

6. Conclusion

Clare County Council notes that the Public Spending Code has been reviewed nationally and the revisions came into effect on 1 January 2020. The Quality Assurance process of the code has not substantially changed.

Across the types of expenditure and over the expenditure lifecycle, it is considered that the Council is broadly compliant with the code, as shown in the checklists. Two expenditure areas were subject to in-depth checks for this report: Capital Expenditure on Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and the R494 Improvement Scheme and Current Expenditure on the Administration of Homeless Service.

Both were found to be broadly compliant with the Public Spending Code.

The updates to the Public Spending Code present an opportunity and rationale for sectoral training roll out to Local Authority project managers. Clare County Council would welcome such refresher training.

CLARE COUNTY COUNCIL

Self-Assessment Checklists 1 to 7

Checklist 1-To be completed in respect of general obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes.

General Obligations not specific to individual	р 88 80 -	Discussion/Action Required
projects/programmes	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	
1.1 Does the organisation ensure, on an ongoing basis, that		Yes, relevant staff are notified of their obligations under the PSC, via Project Management training, liaison with Government funding departments and via internal processes concerning business case
appropriate people within the organisation and its agencies are aware of their requirements of the PSC	2	approval requirements by Management Team for new Capital Projects. Further roll out of training on the revised PSC requirements to the
linel through training/2		Local Government sector is anticipated and welcomed.
1.2 Has internal training on the PSC been provided to relevant staff?	2	In-house briefing sessions have been provided to relevant staff. Project Management training has been rolled out to Project Managers. Some staff participated in training by DPER in Galway in June 2016. No DPER training has been provided since 2016. Further roll out of training on the revised PSC requirements to the Local Government sector is anticipated and welcomed.
1.3 Has the PSC been adapted for the type of project/programme that your organisation is responsible for?	2	Yes. A guidance document has been developed for the PSC QA process, adapted to Local Government structures and approach. A revised document issued in February 2021 (v4).
i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed?		
1.4 Has the organisation in its role as Approving Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the PSC?	N/A	
1.5 Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot	2	Yes, previous recommendations have been submitted to the relevant sections where in-depth checks have taken place for Capital and Current Expenditure.
checks) been disseminated, where appropriate,		Current expenditure.
within the organisation and to agencies?		
1.6 Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon?	2	Follow up audits would be required to verify that recommendations have been acted upon. This will form part of the Multi-Year Internal Audit planning process.
1.7 Has an annual PSC QA report been certified by the organisation Chief Executive, submitted to NOAC and published on the organisation's website?	3	Yes.
1.8 Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP?	3	The required samples of both Current and Capital spending will be reviewed over the 3-year period
1.9 Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations?	2	This applies to projects in excess of €20m . this level of project value is predominancy National infrastructure projects where these projects are completed with the relevant Government departments in one with the
Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability		Public Spending Code and Capital Appraisal guidelines.
1.10 How many formal evaluations have been completed in the year under review? Have they been published in a timely manner?	N/A	No as not applicable for year under review
1.11 is there a process to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations?	N/A	No as not applicable for year under review
1.12 How have the recommendations of reviews and expost evaluations informed resource allocation decisions?	2	The relevant sections have been informed of what recommendations they should consider for future projects.

Checklist 2 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes that were under consideration in the past year

Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval		Comment/Action Required
	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	
2.1 Was a strategic assessment report (SAR) completed for all capital projects and programmes over €10m?	N/A	
2.2 Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	3	Yes, in conjunction with the relevant government department, i.e. approving authority.
2.3 Was a preliminary and final business case, including appropriate financial and economic appraisal, completed for all capital projects and programmes?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.4 Were the proposal objectives SMART and aligned with government policy including National Planning Framework, Climate Migration Plan, etc?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.5 Was an appropriate appraisal method and parameters used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.6 Was a financial appraisal carried out on all proposals and was there appropriate consideration of affordability?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.7 Was the appraisal process commenced at an early enough stage to inform decision making?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.8 Were sufficient options analysed in the business case for each capital proposal?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.9 Was the evidence base for the estimated cost set out in each business case? Was an appropriate methodology used to estimate the cost? Were appropriate budget contingencies put in place?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.10 Was risk considered and a risk mitigation strategy commenced? Was appropriate consideration given to governance and deliverability?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.11 Were the strategic assessment report, preliminary and final business case submitted to DPER for technical review for projects estimated to cost over €100m.	N/A	N/A in 2023
2.12 Was a detailed project brief including design brief and procurement strategy prepared for all investment projects?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.13 Were procurement rules (both national and EU) complied with?	3	Yes
2.14 Was the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) properly implemented?	3	Yes
2.15 Were State Aid rules checked for all support?	N/A	Yes where applicable
2.16 Was approval sought from the Approving Authority at all decision gates?	3	Yes
2.17 Was Value for Money assessed and confirmed at each decision gate by Sponsoring Agency and Approving Authority?	3	Yes
2.18 Was approval sought from government through a Memorandum for Government at the appropriate decision gates for projects estimated to cost over €100m?	N/A	N/A in 2023

Checklist 3 – To be completed in respect of new current expenditure under consideration in the past year.

Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	p	Comment/Action Required
	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	
3.1 Were objectives clearly set out?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.2 Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.3 Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal, prepared for	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory
new current expenditure?		comes under this category
3.4 Was an appropriate appraisal method used?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category inventory
3.5 Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years?	N/A	The items falling into this category are ongoing essential functions, ie maintenance and improvement of LA housing and Roads network
3.6 Did the business case include a section on piloting?	N/A	See above
3.7 Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total	N/A	See above
expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m?		
3.8 Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme?	N/A	See above
3.9 Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Vote Section in DPER?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.10 Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.11 Was the required approval granted?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.12 Has a sunset clause been set?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.13 If outsourcing was involved, were procurement rules complied with?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.14 Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.15 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category

Checklist 4 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grants schemes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

Incurring Capital Expenditure	sed 3	Comment/Action
	Self- Assessed Complianc e Rating: 1-3	Required
4.1 Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval given at each Decision Gate?	2	Yes
4.2 Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?	2	Yes, relevant teams within Departments met on a regular basis.
4.3 Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?	3	All capital programmes are managed by programme coordinators at a suitably senior level.
4.4 Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project?	3	All capital programmes are managed by project managers at a suitably senior level.
4.5 Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?	3	Project reports regularly prepared in most cases and Elected Members/Members of the public are informed by the monthly Chief Executive Report
4.6 Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule?	2	Where budget over-runs occur, documented explanations are available in progress reports and final reports and sanction from the Approving agency is obtained.
4.7 Did budgets have to be adjusted?	2	Yes, with Departmental approval
4.8 Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly?	2	Yes
4.9 Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case incl. CBA/CEA? (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.)	2	Where elements of a scheme are not financially viable, changes are made to ensure value for money or viability withing the councils budget process
4.10 If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/ programme/ grant scheme was the project subjected to adequate examination?	3	Where elements of a scheme are not financially viable, changes are made t ensure value for money or viability withing the councils budget process
4.11 If costs increased or there were other significant changes to the project, was approval received from the Approving Authority?	3	Yes, Sanctioning Authority approved increased costs
4.12 Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of Deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?	N/A	No

Checklist 5 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

Incurring Current Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
5.1 Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?	3	Yes. Spending programmes defined as part of the annual budget process.
5.2 Are outputs well defined?	3	National Key Performance Indicators are in place for Local Government
5.3 Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?	3	Key Performance Indicators are established each year for specific services. Service delivery plans are reviewed periodically. Regular management and progress meetings and implementation of PMDS are examples of monitoring efficiency tools used. Annual reports and Departmental returns also.
5.4 Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an ongoing basis?	3	Yes, budget performance and monitoring is in place, as above. Annual reports and Departmental returns are made. Audits also occur.
5.5 Are outcomes well defined?	3	Annual Service Delivery Plans enhance this measurement. Also, Corporate Plans, Annual Budget, Annual Report, County Development Plan, meetings with the Department.
5.6 Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?	2	Annual Service Delivery Plans enhance this measurement. Also, Annual Reports and Quarterly Financial Reporting
5.7 Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?	3	The Council complies with National Key Performance Indicators in relation to cost per unit and costing is also carried out by service.
5.8 Are other data compiled to monitor performance?	3	Yes, Data compiled in each service area, monthly expenditure monitoring, Annual Budget and AFS processes facilitate monitoring.
5.9 Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an ongoing basis?	2	Yes. All expenditure is evaluated annually across these service levels as part of the Budget process and Annual Reports, Quarterly Financial Reporting and the monthly Chief Executive Report.
5.10 Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' 1 of programmes/projects?	2	The Council has co-operated in all the VFM studies and subsequent progress reviews issued by the Department's VFM unit. Under 'other evaluations' there was LGAS review. Customer surveys and external assessments are also done on occasion.

¹ Evaluation proofing involves checking to see if the required data are being collected so that when the time comes a programme/project can be subjected to a robust evaluation. If the data are not being collected, then a plan should be put in place to collect the appropriate indicators to allow for the completion of a robust evaluation down the line.

Checklist 6 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes discontinued in the year under review.

Capital Expenditure Recently Completed	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
6.1 How many project completion reports were completed in the year under review?	2	Two
6.2 Were lessons learned from Project Completion Reports incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	2	Yes
6.3 How many Project Completion Reports were published in the year under review?	2	2 circulated to the relevant funding departments and 1 before the Audit Committee
6.4 How many Ex-Post Evaluations were completed in the year under review?	N/a	None as not applicable for year under review
6.5 How many Ex-Post Evaluations were published in the year under review?	N/a	None as not applicable for year under review
6.6 Were lessons learned from Ex-Post Evaluations incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	N/a	None as not applicable for year under review
6.7 Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluations carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	2	Project managers in the Housing Department complete Project Completion Reports and these reports are reviewed by the relevant Government Department
6.8 Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluation Reports for projects over €50m sent to DPER for dissemination?	N/A	

Checklist 7 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued.

Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
7.1 Were reviews carried out of current	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC
expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?		in 2023
7.2 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2023
7.3 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2023
7.4 Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2023
7.5 Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2023
7.6 Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2023
7.7 Were changes made to the organisation's practices in light of lessons learned from reviews?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2023

APPENDIX B In-depth reviews

Quality Assurance - In Depth Check for 2023

A. Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing, R494 Improvement Project

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section provides a summary of the programme or project in question.

	Programme or Project Information
Name	Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement
Detail	The construction of a western bypass around Killaloe, the installation of a new bridge crossing the River Shannon, and an upgrade of the existing R494 regional road from Ballina to the R445 at Birdhill. The new bridge will link the proposed Killaloe bypass to the R494 and provide a crossing over the River Shannon.
Responsible Body	Project Lead: Clare County Council The Council entered into an S85 agreement with Tipperary County Council.
Current Status	Expenditure being incurred
Start Date	2003
End Date	On-going Target completion of the project is by 2025.
Overall Cost	The project inventory lists the total project cost as €69,000,000 (2018-2022). However, the approved Final Business Case indicates a total project budget cost of €86,972,114.22.

Section A: Introduction

Project Description

Its primary aim is to provide appropriate road infrastructure in the towns of Killaloe and Ballina, which face challenges due to heavy traffic, endangering their historical character and community infrastructure. The scheme is designed to accommodate the anticipated local, regional and national development in this The Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement Scheme were proposed by Clare County Council and North Tipperary County Council.

Section B: Evaluation

Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Crowleys DFK has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement Project. A PLM serves as a standard evaluation tool. Additional information regarding the tool is available in the Public Spending Code.

Outcomes	Improved journey time and efficiency between the Birdhill roundabout and the R463 north of Killaloe. Reduced risk to pedestrians crossing the Shannon at Killaloe. Improved air quality and reduced levels of traffic noise and vibration in Killaloe village.
Outputs	The expected outputs of the project are as follows: Killaloe Bypass — the construction of a western bypass around Killaloe, linking a new bridge to the R463 along the west bank of Lough Derg. This will divert traffic away from Killaloe. Shannon Bridge Crossing —focused on establishing a new road crossing of the
Activities	for this The project involved the budget following key activities: £91m. • The development and approval of the business case, which included financial and economic appraisals. • Conducting a tendering process for engineering consultancy services and the main construction • Consultancy services and the main construction • Shannon Bridge Crossing of the new road crossing of the new budget or the services and divert traffic away from consultancy services and the main construction • Shannon Bridge Crossing new road crossing of the new road crossing of the consultancy services and the main construction or stablishing a new road crossing of the consultance or stablishing a new road crossing of the consultance or stablishing a new road crossing of the consultance or stablishing a new road crossing or the consultance or co
Input	
Objective	The project's objectives are as The primary input follows: • Killaloe Bypass – to establish a western bypass around the town of Killaloe, linking the R463 to the north of town with the proposed Shannon Bridge Crossing section and the R463 to the south of the town. • Shannon Bridge Crossing – to construct a bridge

Section B: Evaluation			
spanning the River		Programme planning,	River Shannon, positioned •
Shannon, connecting the		supervision, and	to the south of Killaloe. Its
proposed Killaloe Bypass		monitoring of the process.	purpose is to relieve the
with the R494.	•	Review of the annual	congested Old Killaloe
R494 Improvement —		costs incurred against the	bridge by providing an •
involves widening,		business case estimate	alternative route for

River Shannon, positioned	to the south of Killaloe. Its	purpose is to relieve the	congested Old Killaloe	bridge by providing an	alternative route for	traffic flow.
planning,	and	monitoring of the process.	Review of the annual	costs incurred against the	business case estimate	and preparation of the
Programme	supervision,	monitoring	Review of	costs incurre	business G	and prepar

ine improvements to the entails implementing on-R494, which will link the new bridge with the M7 R494 Improvement ink road at Birdhill.

yearly forecast.

extending all the way to

the junction with the R445

Birdhill

οĘ

regrading, and realigning

with the R496 to the

proposed Shannon bridge,

the R494 from its junction

increased walking and cycling in the vicinity of

Killaloe.

conservation Reduced social exclusion improved CLARdesignated areas in East t و accessibility through nature areas. Clare.

Minimised and mitigated

impacts

negative

transportation strategies increased support for the Development Plan and the national, regional and ocal tourism strategies set out in the Clare County nse or the area. land

Description of Programme Logic Model

- The primary objectives of the scheme are as follows: Objective
- To facilitate local, regional and national development policy and objectives;
- To provide a second river crossing between the towns of Killaloe and Ballina and to reduce congestion and delays on the existing Killaloe
- To improve traffic safety by diverting through traffic away from the existing route over the Killaloe Bridge;
- To improve the environment of Ballina/Killaloe by removing a significant portion of north/south through traffic;
- To upgrade the R494 to enhance accessibility for pedestrians and cyclists while improving road safety measures; and
- To reduce travel times along the route.

Seci	Section B: Evaluation	ation	
•	Input	**	The primary input for this project is the capital budget allocation of €91m.
•	Activities	•••	A number of key activities were carried out through the scheme including the development and approval of the business case, the tendering process and awarding of contracts for engineering consultancy services and main construction works, programme planning, supervision and monitoring including a variance analysis between the annual costs incurred against the business case estimate.
•	Outputs	***	The expected outputs of this project are as follows: Killaloe Bypass – a western bypass of Killaloe, connecting this new bridge with the R463 along the west bank of Lough Derg, removing through traffic from Killaloe.
			 Shannon Bridge Crossing – a new road crossing of the River Shannon, south of Killaloe, relieving the congested Old Killaloe bridge. R494 Improvement – on-line improvements to the R494, connecting this new bridge with the M7 link road at Birdhill.
•	Outcomes	••	The Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement project is expected to yield various outcomes, such as the following: Improved journey time and efficiency between the Birdhill roundabout and the R463 north of Killaloe
			 Reduced risk to pedestrians crossing the Shannon at Killaloe.
			 Improved air quality and reduced the level of traffic noise and vibration in Killaloe village.
			 Minimised and mitigated negative impacts on nature conservation areas.
			 Reduced social exclusion through improved accessibility to CLAR-designated areas in East Clare.

Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project / Programme

The following section tracks the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement Project from inception to conclusion, highlighting major project/programme milestones:

Increased support for the land use and transportation strategies set out in the Clare County Development Plan and the national, regional and

Increased walking and cycling in the vicinity of Killaloe.

local tourism strategies for the area.

March 2009 An inter-authority agreement under section 85 of the Local Government Act 2001 was established between Clare County Council and North Tipperary County Council.

February 2012 October 2012 March 2013 January 2019 December 2019 August 2020 2021

	:021 The electronic tender opening was conducted by the Councillor, Senior Engineer, and Executive Engineer.	The final business case for the scheme was reviewed and approved.	.021 John Sisk & Son (Holdings) Ltd. was identified as the successful tenderer for the project, selected as the most economically advantageous option.	The Department of Transport granted approval to award the main construction contract to John Sisk & Sons (Holdings) Ltd., acknowledging the Tender Assessment Report dated December 2021 and approving the Business Case dated November 2021. In line with this decision, a Letter of Regret was sent to the unsuccessful tenderers.	:022 Tenders were submitted by participants within the framework for the provision of engineering consultancy services. Subsequently, the received tenders were opened for evaluation and review.	:022 • Acceptance of Tender: The tender for the provision of engineering consultancy services was accepted after evaluation.	 Appointment of Construction Supervision Team: RPS Consulting Engineers Ltd. was appointed as the construction supervision team. 	 Appointment of Main Works Contractor: John Sisk & Sons (Holdings) Ltd. was appointed as the main construction contract through Chief Executive Orders PMO 03/22 and PMO 02/22, respectively. 	 Awarding of Contract for Civil Engineering Works: John Sisk & Son (Holdings) Ltd. was awarded the contract for civil engineering works through a Letter of Acceptance. 	The	finalised through a Letter of Acceptance. Following this, construction works commence, as do meetings with various stakeholders.	:022 The Contract Award Notice for the main construction works contract awarded to John Sisk & Sons (Holdings) Ltd. is published in the Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU).
Section B: Evaluation	November 2021		December 2021		January 2022	February 2022				August 2022		November 2022

Ongoing Ongoing

Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to the appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing and R494 Improvement Project.

	Project/Programme Key Documents
Title	Evidence of compliance
Clare County Council – Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge & R494 Improvement Initial Business Case	The preliminary business case provides an overview of the project, including the need for the scheme, any alternatives and other options considered, the use of analysis tools to select the preferred option, and an appraisal of the impact of the proposed scheme.
Clare County Council – Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing & R494 Improvement Final Business Case	The final business case is constructed based on the preliminary business case, incorporating updated information from the tendering process. Its purpose is to conduct a detailed appraisal to determine whether the project is justified and worth proceeding with.
Procurement Documents	These include a variety of materials, including the tender publication documents, tender evaluation reports, contracts and other relevant paperwork associated with the procurement process.
Client Progress Reports and Employer Monthly Progress Reports	Client Progress Reports and Employer Monthly as health and safety, environmental/sustainability, quality control, construction programme and progress Reports Progress Reports Updates, contract status and financial valuations.

Steering Committee Meetings Minutes	inese minutes serve to summarise the updates provided by the contractor and site supervision team to the Steering Committee regarding the progress of the project.
Summary Variance Comparison	This document presents the actual costs incurred compared to the estimated costs outlined in the business case and the yearly forecast.

Key Document 1: Clare County Council - Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge & R494 Improvement Initial Business Case

the use of analysis tools to select a preferred option, and an appraisal of the impact of the proposed scheme. The proposed evaluation plan entails This comparison will allow for an estimation of the extent to which forecasted journey time savings have been achieved. This evaluation plan was conducting a post-project review once the full construction costs are determined, and all the contractor claims have been settled. The review will gather data on traffic levels for both the new and existing bridges, as well as traffic flow on the bypass and the bypassed R463 route. Additionally, it will track end-to-end journey times. These indicators of benefit will be compared with initial forecasts and aligned with both forecast and outturn scheme costs. The preliminary business case provides an overview of the project, including the need for the scheme, any alternatives and other options considered, completed and approved in January 2019.

Key Document 2: Clare County Council - Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge Crossing & R494 Improvement Final Business Case

is to conduct a detailed appraisal to determine whether the project is justified and worth proceeding with. It includes the design standard for the mainline The scheme was procured by CCC in accordance with the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) developed by the Government Contracts The final business case is constructed based on the preliminary business case, incorporating updated information from the tendering process. Its purpose road which was designed in accordance with the geometric standards of the Transport Infrastructure Ireland (TII) Design Manual for Roads and Bridges. Committee for Construction (GCCC). The procurement strategy employed is a traditional Employer's Design scheme using the Public Works Contract for Civil Engineering Works designed by the Employer. This document was completed and approved in November 2021

Key Document 3: Procurement Documents

These include a variety of materials, including the tender publication documents, tender evaluation reports, contracts and other relevant paperwork associated with the procurement process. These include the tender publication documents, tender evaluation reports, contracts, and other relevant paperwork associated with the procurement process. The observations made during the review of the programme's procurement files are outlined in Section 6 of this report.

Key Document 4: Client Progress Reports and Employer Monthly Progress Reports

The contractor for main construction works, John Sisk & Sons (Holdings) Ltd., prepares on a monthly basis Client Progress Reports, which outline the current progress on the project, along with information on health and safety, environmental/sustainability, quality control, construction programme the site supervision team, RPS Consulting Engineers Ltd., prepares their own Employer Monthly Progress Reports summarising the overall project status. and progress, design progress, interface management, commercial and general procurement status, contract updates and valuations. On the other hand, These reports cover key issues in the following areas:

- health and safety,
- construction progress,
- planned activities for the next period,
- schedule,
- nonconformances,
- financial matters,
- scope changes,
- o procurement,
- o stakeholder and landowner communications,
- risk and opportunities,
- o actions taken to address issues, ensuring project risk and critical issues are identified.

While neither the client nor employer monthly progress reports include forward-reporting against the target scheme cost and target completion date, CCC performs the annual variance analysis and yearly forecasts for the project, which are discussed during the Steering Committee meetings

Key Document 5: Steering Committee Meeting Minutes

The Steering Committee Meeting Minutes provides a summary of the project's progress, encompassing key areas such as health and safety, construction, programme management, design/technical aspects, third-party consultations, procurement activities, risk register updates, and commercial aspects.

Key Document 6: Summary Variance Comparison

This document, presented in an Excel file, provides a comparison between the actual costs incurred annually and the estimates outlined in the business case, along with yearly forecasts. It serves as a focal point of discussion during Steering Committee meetings.

Step 4: Data Audit

The following section outlines the data audit that was carried out for the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and R494 Improvement Project. It evaluates the availability of appropriate data for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Transport Integration, Land-Use Integration, Geographic Integration, and Other Policy Integration	To evaluate and assess the integration impact of the project and confirm that the project has led to an increase in tourist activity within Killaloe and its vicinity.	Not yet applicable, project is still ongoing.
Journey time data through Automatic Number Plate Recognition	Journey time data through Automatic To demonstrate improvements in journey times at Number Plate Recognition	Not yet applicable, project is still ongoing.
Air quality and noise	To demonstrate improvements in noise levels and air quality.	Not yet applicable, project is still ongoing.
Natural environment impact	To report on the local habitat of a small number of protected species and assess for any significant changes.	Not yet applicable, project is still ongoing.

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data pertinent to the current stage of the project is available on file. The project is still ongoing.

Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section examines key evaluation questions regarding the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and R494 Improvement Project based on the findings from the previous sections of this report. Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage) Upon reviewing the information provided, Internal Audit found that the delivery of this project complies with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code, with the exception of the following improvements:

- 1. The Strategic Assessment Report is not retained on file.
- For one (1) of the procurements sampled, while the Senior Engineer did confirm that the evaluators did confirm at the commencement of process that there was no conflict of interest, the evaluators did not complete and sign a written declaration of conflict of interest prior to the evaluátion. Best practice going forward will be to have a written confirmation from the parties on file.
- Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date? All data pertinent to the current stage of the project is available on file. The project is still ongoing.
- What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Based on the substantive testing and walkthroughs performed for the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and R494 Improvement Project, it is recommended that management ensure that:

- 1. The strategic assessment report is retained on file.
- The gaps identified above are addressed to ensure compliance with the procurement policy and procedures. The recommendations related to these findings are discussed in detail in <u>Sections 6 and 7</u> of this report.

Section C: Summary and Conclusions

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and R494 Improvement Project.

Section: In Depth Check Summary

Apart from the minor gaps identified in Section B above, Internal Audit noted substantial compliance with the provisions of the Public Spending Code for the Killaloe Bypass, Shannon Bridge and R494 Improvement Project.

Quality Assurance - In Depth Check for 2023

Section A: Introduction

A. Administration of Homeless Services

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section provides a summary of the programme or project in question.

	Programme or Project Information
Name	Administration of Homeless Services
Detail	Prevention of Homelessness and reduce the need for emergency homeless accommodation
Responsible Body	Clare County Council.
Current Status	Revenue Expenditure Being Incurred
Start Date	1st January 2023
End Date	31st December 2023
Overall Cost	€ 3,397,916

Project Description

The administration of Homeless Services is managed by the Housing Section of Clare County Council. The total expenditure for the service in 2023 was €3,397,916.

increasing rents are resulting in people finding themselves in a homeless situation. Most cases presenting as homeless are also further complicated due to Clare County Council face significant challenges in dealing with individuals and families presenting as homeless. Lack of affordable rental properties and issues such as mental health, addictions, anti-social behaviour and family breakdown.

Section Av Introduktion

management of homeless people and individuals at the risk of homeless. Clare County Council submit quarterly homelessness expenditure returns to Limerick City & County Council who administer the allocated Departmental funding for the homelessness services for the region. Direct service expenditure is 90% Section 10 funded, with the balance borne by the Clare County Council as part of its annual budget allocations. The total Section 10 income in 2023 was €2.7m, Clare County Council is included in the Mid-West Homeless Action Team which provides a coordinated, inter agency response to the support needs and case with a net cost of £0.7million.

Clare County Council has entered into Service Level Agreements with a number of Service Providers who provide supports in emergency and long-term accommodation, along with Tenancy Sustainment Supports..

The overall aim of the service is to reduce the requirement for emergency accommodation and provide long term housing solutions.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Clare County Council Internal Audit unit has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Administration Secure permanent and Reduction in people living in temporary accommodation. accommodation Outcomes independent emergency sustainable long-term rough sleeping and in Reduction in people Increase number of accommodation accommodation people in more Outputs hotel/b & b approach to source to reduce the need prevention service to the provision of homeless services. homeless families regional approach term dependency and to avoid long accommodation accommodation. accommodation on B & B/hotel for emergency mplement an effective early in emergency Implement a intervention supports for appropriate interagency Provide an Activities homeless solutions. Service **Expenditure of** Input €3,397,916 Third Party **Providers** 5 FTE of Homeless Services in 2023. prevent appropriate accommodation and provide long term housing solutions. requirement for Objective To reduce the homelessness emergency providing supports 0

Manage the provision of emergency accommodation along with the HSE and other various		
Service Providers		_

Description of Programme Logic Model

Input

- the objectives of the Homeless Service are to prevent homelessness by early intervention, providing temporary emergency Objective
 - accommodation and delivering a long-term housing solution.
- Prevention of homelessness in the first instance by early intervention. Providing emergency accommodation for those eligible for the service. Working with other agencies through the Homeless Action Team (HAT) to provide a structured solution to each homeless case. Aftercare services provided to help tenancy sustainment. Activities

The main inputs are the salaries of Homeless Services Team staff and funding to support emergency accommodation partners.

Reduction in people rough sleeping or in hotel/B & B accommodation Outputs

.

Reduction in number of homeless presentations due to early intervention. Providing a long-term housing solution and less reliance for temporary emergency accommodation. Outcomes

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/ Programme

The following section tracks the Administration of Homeless Services from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

The Homeless Service is an ongoing service provided by Clare County Council. Funding for providing the service is included in the Annual Budget.

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the Administration of Homeless Services during 2023.

Project/Programme Key Documents	Details	Regional Plan includes the strategic aims and objectives and outlines the regional implementation framework	Annual budget and expenditure on homeless service is available for 2023	Policy and procedure document refers to the placement of persons presenting as Homeless	 Annual Service Delivery Plan Corporate Plan 2019 – 2024 Chief Executive Reports
	Title	Mid-West Region Homelessness Action Plan 2022 - 2025	Agresso FMS	Central Placement Policy	Other reports

Key Document 1: Mid-West Region Homeless Action Plan 2022 – 2025

and where this is unavoidable that the period spent in emergency accommodation is as short and as successful as it can be. The plan outlines the long-term The Regional Homelessness Management Group, in consultation with the Regional Homeless forum, prepared the Regional Homelessness Action Plan 2022 (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2009. The overall aim of this plan is to ensure that people are diverted from homeless accommodation in the first instance - 2025. The development of this Mid-West Regional Homelessness Action Plan is in according with Part 2, Chapter 6, Section 40 (10) of the Housing vision for homelessness in the Mid-West region and the regional structures in place to achieve it.

Key Document 2: Agresso FMS

Reports can be generated from Agresso detailing the level of expenditure paid in relation to payroll costs and accommodation costs. This allows management to monitor budget adherence during the year.

Key Document 3: Clare County Council's Central Placement Policy

This policy details the legislation and the National Policy framework for providing homeless services. It sets out the criteria for being eligible for a homeless service. It includes the emergency accommodation options and the conditions of stay in this accommodation. It sets out the support services available to exit emergency accommodation.

Key Document 4: Other reports

This includes the Annual Service Delivery Plan and Corporate Plan 2019 - 2024 which sets out clear objectives for their duration on the delivery of the service and the Chief Executive Report provides key information on the current state of Homelessness in Clare County Council.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out regarding Administration of Homeless Services in 2023. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Homelessness Data	The Pathway Accommodation and Support System (PASS) is an online shared system utilised by every homeless service provider and all local authorities in Ireland. The system provides 'real-time' information in terms of homeless presentations and bed occupancy	Yes – PASS system
Homelessness Presentations	Personal details of homeless presentations including background history and reason for homelessness.	Yes – files in Housing Section
Finance Reports	Reports available on Agresso in relation to budgets and spend on homeless services. Also shows income from recoupment claims	Yes – Agresso FMS

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

Data is available on the PASS system, the housing files and Agresso to carry out a full evaluation on the Administration of the Homeless Service.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the Administration of Homeless Services based on the findings from the previous sections of this report. Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

This in-depth check has shown that the Administration of Homeless Services complies reasonably with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

The necessary data and information are available from files, data and systems held in the Housing Section, and the Agresso Financial Management

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Engage in the procurement process for both Emergency Accommodation & Service Provider. While value for money is priority for this department, it will ensure fairness and good governance is achieved. Improvements to the documentation collated relating to client/ landlords and Service Providers need to be reviewed and enhanced to ensure a good audit trail.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Administration of Homeless Services in 2023.

During the course of this review the following good practices were observed within the HAT department.

That good collaboration and clear professional communication are evident within the team and the wider housing section, including weekly meetings with various interlinked agencies such as HSE / MID West Simom and Limerick County & City Council to name a few.

The early intervention (prior knowledge of notice to quit) has kept several clients out of entering Emergency Accommodation.

GDPR is high on their priority agenda (due to the sensitive nature of the information stored) and compliance with these guidelines is paramount.

Expenditure, Income & Budget

A budget for the Administration of Homeless Services is approved by the Council annually and the Agresso Financial Management System is used to record all income and expenditure and is used for monitoring same with an expenditure budget of €3,397,916 in 2023.

It is important that expenditure is monitored and controlled in order to achieve value for money and to ensure the effective use of resources.

Conclusion

Clare County Council provide a responsive and effective emergency homeless service to those in needs of supports. Internal Audit recommend that they continue the operation of the Housing Action Team (HAT) to provide an interagency approach to source appropriate supports for homelessness in emergency accommodation and to avoid long term dependency on B & B/hotel accommodation. Clare County Council is included in the Mid-West Region Homelessness forum, together with the Health Service Executive (HSE) and relevant statutory and voluntary agencies. Limerick City and County Council has been designated as lead authority for the Mid-West region. A greater emphasis is now placed on prevention and intervention of homelessness with the recent addition of a placement officer to the team. Audit Opinion: In so far as Clare County Council's compliance with the Homeless Revenue Expenditure, it is considered that the programme is in substantial compliance with the Public Spending Code.

APPENDIX C

Details of Projects and Programmes that exceeded €500,000 during 2023

		Expenditure bein	g Considered - Grea	ter than €0.5m	(Capital and Current)		
		Experience belli	Capital	Capital			
		Current Expenditure	Expenditure	Expenditure	Project/Programme		
		Amount in Reference	Amount in	Amount in	Anticipated	Projected Lifetime	
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Year	Reference Year	Reference	Timeline	•	Explanatory Notes
Current Expenditure Programme - Increases over		rcui	Reference real	Reference		Experience	Explanatory Notes
A01 Maintenance & Improvement of LA Housing I	•	€1,439,011.00					
A05 Administration of Homeless Service	Programme increase	€946,327.00					
A07 RAS and Leasing Programme	Programme increase	€1,169,468.00					
A09 Housing Grants	Programme increase	€3,742,587.00					
B03 Regional Roads - Maintenance and improvem		€712,751.00					
B04 Local Road - Maintenance and Improvement	Programme increase	€536,275.00					
CO5 Administration of Group & Private Installatio	ŭ	€569,342.00					
D05 Tourism Development & Promotion	Programme increase	€13,465,706.00					
D06 Community and Enterprise Function	Programme increase	€1,802,674.00					
D09 Economic Development and Promotion	Programme increase	€4,813,760.00					
E11 Operation of Fire Service	Programme increase	€1,318,691.00					
F03 Outdoor Leisure Areas Operation	Programme increase	€500,070.00					
		2222,070100					
Housing & Building							
Market Street, Ennis, 14 units.	Turnkey CALF	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2024	€1,268,201.00	
Ballaghboy, Quin Road, Ennis, 5 houses	Social housing construction - Tra	€0.00	€0.00		2023 - 2024	€1,054,873.00	
Bruachlan, Westbury, 22 units	Voluntary housing (CAS)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2024	€2,300,000.00	
Acha Bhile, Lahinch Road, 33 units	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2024	€3,186,810.00	
Kilrush, 41 units (Convent)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2025	€5,000,000.00	
Kilkee, 23 units	Social Housing construction	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2024	€6,900,707.00	
Clarecastle 7 apartments	Turnkey social housing	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2024	€2,500,000.00	
Sixmilebridge (30 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2024-2025	€3,150,000.00	
Shallee Drive / Cloughleigh Road, 5 units	Social Housing Construction	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2025	€1,323,886.00	
Back Road, Kilrush 18 Units	Social Housing Construction	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2025	€4,223,521.00	
Golf Links (30 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2024-2025	€10,800,000.00	
Tobertaiscean, Ennis (7 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2024-2025	€750,000.00	
Quin (36 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2024	€3,355,824.00	
Inagh (12 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2024-2026	€1,300,000.00	
Cappahard, Ennis (13 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2024	€1,300,000.00	
Clonroad, Ennis (12 units)	Voluntary housing (CAS)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2024	€3,443,039.00	
Development Management							
Gort Road Business Park – Parking improvemer	Parking	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2024	€625,000.00	
West Clare Remediation project	ACM - Remediation	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2022-2027	€7,500,000.00	
	Failte ireland Outdoor Amenity						
West Clare Failte ireland Outdoor Activity Facility	/ Building	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2025	€1,300,000.00	
Waterpark house parking	Carpark extension	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2025	€1,500,000.00	
Cloister Car park	Carpark development	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2024	€2,000,000.00	
Ennis Town Bus Service/Depot & Carpark	NTA Funded	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2025	€3,000,000.00	NTA Funded
Public Realm and Site Consolidation at Roche	New Road Access	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2025	€1,000,000.00	
Recreation & Amenity							
	Loop Head Lighthouse (Phase						Estimated Cost. Order of Magnitude cost plan to be
Loop Head Lighthouse Visitor Centre	2)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023-2026	€5,000,000.00	confirmed. RRDF 1 Funding to be sought.
Miscelleaneous Services							
Totals		€31,016,662.00	€ -	€ -		€73,781,861.00	

			Expend	liture being Incurred - G	reater than €0.5m (Capital	and Current)		
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to- date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)	Explanatory Notes
Housing & Building								
Housing Planned Maintenance Programme	Upgrade of LA stock	€0.00	€0.00	€1,469,617.19	2018 - 2028	€5,019,948.34	£10,000,000,00	Council long term non-mortgage loan funding
	Buy and renew construction		€0.00		2022 - 2024	€5,346.70	€1,800,000.00	
Cappahard, Ennis (26 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00		2022-2023	€2,538,826.00		CALF Funded 100% - completed in 2023 but funds paid in Jan 2024
Cluain Laoi, Kilkishen, 16 units	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00		2023 - 2024	€499,990.00		CALF Funded 100%
Clarehill, Clarecastle, 13 houses	Turnkey social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2023 - 2024	€487,929,75	€6,000,000.00	
Loughville, Ennis 48 houses	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00		2023 - 2025	€861.00		CALF Funded 100%
Maddens Tce, Clarecastle, 2 units	Social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2020 - 2023	€895,127.30		Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Ballyminogue, Scariff, 18 units	Social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2021 - 2024	€2.472.178.46		Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Ennistymon, 30 units	Social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2021 - 2024	€218,782.05		Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Doonbeg lands, 8 units	Social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2021 - 2024	€184,296,57		Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Drumcliff Road, 26 units	Social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2021 - 2024	€885,834.71		Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Ballyliddan West, Sixmilebridge 15 units	Social housing	€0.00	€0.00		2021 - 2024	€2,143,809.00		Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Moore St, Kilrush 21 Units	Turnkey	€0.00	€0.00		2021 - 2024	€2,143,809.00 €571,837.36	€5,654,000.00	
	runikey	€0.00	€0.00	€509,100.00	2022-2024	€5/1,83/.3b	€0,000,000.00	
LIHAF Local Infrastructure Housing Activation Fund ,					2022 5	000100-	co coo oc	
Claureen	L.I.H.A.F CLAUREEN ENNIS	€0.00	€0.00		2023-2025	€594,660.71	€8,600,000.00	
Gort Road, Ennis, 20 houses	Social Housing constructio	€0.00	€0.00	€64,648.11	2023 - 2024	€176,168.82	€5,723,435.00	
Road Transportation & Safety								
	2.2km national road							
N19 Shannon airport access road	upgrade	€0.00	€0.00		2023 - 2025	€1,293,071.54		TII road realignment funded 100%. Pl permission Summer '24. Design done
Public Lighting Energy Efficiency Project	LED lights changeover	€0.00	€0.00		2020 - 2023	€1,673,222.82		Council long term non-mortgage loan funding
Flood Relief Scheme Shannon Town and Environs	Flood protection	€0.00	€0.00		2019 - 2025	€1,796,863.36		OPW and Department grant funded 100%
Flood relief scheme South East Clare	Flood protection	€0.00	€0.00		2023 - 2027	€1,211,784.54		OPW and Department grant funded 100%
Flood Relief scheme at West Clare	Flood protection	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023 - 2026	€109,415.00	€600,000.00	OPW and Department grant funded 100%
	New bridge, bypass, road							
Killaloe Bypass & Shannon Bridge Crossing	upgrade	€0.00	€0.00	€31,543,100.48	2018 - 2025	€60,306,165.71	€86,972,144.00	TII road realignment funded 100%
Coastal protection West Clare	Coastal Protection	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2022 - 2025	€99,757.48	€1,500,000.00	
Active Travel	Ballycasey Active Travel	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2022-2023	€555,262.00	€555,262.00	Ballycasey Active Travel
Council long term non-mortgage loan funding Shannon	PLEEP	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2026-2027	€629,117.79	€2,000,000.00	Council long term non-mortgage loan funding Shannon PLEEP
Ennistymon Inner Relief Road	Blakes Corner	€0.00	€0.00	€12,974.82	2019-2026	€1,189,646.50		TII road realignment funded 100%
,								•
Development Management								
Ennis Public Realm Phase 2	URDF Public Realm	€0.00	€0.00	€1,134,361.95	2022 - 2025	€1,909,044.81	€14,000,000,00	€12m URDF works (75% Grant funded), €2m Uisce Eireann works (100% fund
Ennistymon Tourism Destination Town Project	Failte Ireland Destination	€0.00	€0.00		2020-2024	€724,946.36		Failte Ireland funding with 25% own resources
	Multi service hub & Public					0. = 1,0 10.00	02,200,000.00	8
Scariff Town Regeneration Project	Realm	€0.00	€0.00	€197,197.43	2023 - 2024	€503,971.81	€4,000,000.00	
Scann rownnegeneration roject	Multi service hub & Public			C157,157.45	2025 2024	000,571.01	C-1,000,000.00	
Shannon Public Realm Enhancements	Realm	€0.00	€0.00	€146,019.11	2023-2028	€688.000.48	€30,000,00.00	
Maritime Education Facility	Maritime Education Zone (€0.00	€0.00		2023-2027	€512,771.98	€10,000,00.00	
Abbey Riverside	Master Plan & Design	€0.00	€0.00		2023-2027	€768.328.52	€15,000,000,00	
Harveys Quay	Master Plan & Design	€0.00	€0.00		2023-2026	€/68,328.52 €454,350.57	€15,000,000.00 €15,000,000.00	
Post Office field	Master Plan & Design	€0.00	€0.00		2023-2026	€54,217.00	€5,000,000.00	
Francis Street	Design to Planning	€0.00	€0.00	€162,360.00	2023-2026	€204,532.37	€13,000,000.00	
Recreation & Amenity								
Ennis Library	New library	€0.00	€0.00		2017 - 2025	€12,441,360.63		Part grant, part Council non-mortgage loan funded
Greenway Development	Greenway Development	€0.00	€0.00	€313,389.88	2023-2026	€1,495,842.60	€5,000,000.00	
Land for Economic Development EMD	Land Acquisition- Gaurus	€0.00	€0.00	0.00	2023-2027	€1,174,492.00	€1,174,492.00	These lands are not yet fully assessed in terms of their potential for development- work may be done on this in 2024
	The Rectory Refurbishment and associated works. Inis							
	Cealtra	€0.00	€0.00	€57,198.00	2023-2025	€1,640,834.20	67 000 000 0	DDDE 1 for all a with 2007 hands for all as force Class County County
Inis Cealtra	Conversion of the Stable	€0.00	€0.00	€57,198.00	2023-2025	€1,040,834.20	€7,000,000.00	RRDF 1 funded with 20% Match funding from Clare County Council.
	Block to Bistro Facilities at			6200 640 67	2022 2022	6200 540 57	64 500 000 00	
Vandeleur Experience - Restaurant	Vandeleur.	€0.00	€0.00	€308,618.67	2023-2023	€308,618.67	€1,500,000.00	Loan funded project with tourism reserves committed to pay back the loan
	Cliffs OF Moher							
Cliffs Of Moher Strategy Development	reinvestment	€0.00	€0.00	€9,016,406.21	2020-2026	€10,763,013.94	€15,000,000.00	
	Tourism Site Remediation							
East Clare Tourism Facility Development		€0.00	€0.00	€946,590.00	2024-2027	€946,590.00	€5,000,000.00	
	Tourism Site Remediation Platforms for Growth.							€1,200,000 funded from Fáilte Ireland, this to be co-managed with General
East Clare Failte ireland Outdoor Activity Facility	Ballycuggeran.	€0.00	€0.00	€18,403.05	2022-2025	€37,946.00	€1,200,000.00	Design Office.
Adi								
Miscelleaneous Services								
Land for Economic Development EMD	Property Acquistion-	€0.00	€0.00	€437,917.07	2022-2023	€1,519,307.65	€1,519,307.65	

REVENUE EXPENDITURE							
A04 - Housing Community Development Support	€1,171,821.00		€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
A06 - Support to Housing Capital Programme	€2,170,634.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
A08 - Housing Loans	€743,417.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
B02 - NS Road - Maintenance and Improvement	€1,628,180.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
B05- Public Lighting	€2,748,610.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
B07 - Road Safety Engineering Improvement	€556,832.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
B09 - Car Parking	€698,135.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
C01 - Water Supply	€4,550,095.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
C02 - Waste Water Treatment	€2,107,618.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
C08-Local Authority Water and Sanitary Services	€645,235.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
D01 - Forward Planning	€1,324,568.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
D02 - Development Management	€909,198.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
D03 - Enforcement	€591,643.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E01 - Landfill Operation and Aftercare	€759,442.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E02 - Recovery & Recycling Facilities Operations	€1,955,025.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E05 - Litter Management	€571,066.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E06 - Street Cleaning	€1,780,601.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E09 - Maintenance of Burial Grounds	€1,034,075.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E10 - Safety of Structures and Places	€904,141.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E13 - Water Quality, Air and Noise Pollution	€514,763.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
E15 - Climate Change and Flooding	€764,901.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
F01 - Leisure Facilities Operations	€1,787,406.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
F02-Operation of Library and Archival Sercive	€4,576,129.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
F05 - Operation of Arts Programme	€1,469,112.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
H03 - Administration of Rates	€3,633,064.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
H09 - Local Representation and Civil Leadership	€2,455,844.00	€ -	€ -	Annual programme	€ - €	-	
Totals	€ 42,051,555.00	€ -	€ 60,544,313.74		€121,020,072.62	€313,289,321.65	

	Projects/	Programmes Completed or disc	continued in the reference year	- Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Curren	t)		
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description		Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Completion Date	Final Outturn Expenditure	Explanatory Notes
Vacant stock 2023	Stock upgrade	€0.00	€0.00	€2,091,873.00	2023	€2,091,873.00	
DPG Stock 2022	Stock adaptation	€0.00	€0.00	€721,445.14	2023	€721,445.14	
Housing & Building							
Limerick Road Sixmilebridge, (28 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023	€0.00	Withdrawn
Roslevan, (25 units)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€2,148,095.00	2023	€2,148,095.00	Completed
Riverwood, Kilrush, (31 units)	Voluntary Housing (CAS) acquisition	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023	€0.00	Discontinued
Kilkee, (12 apartments)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2023	€0.00	Discontinued
Limerick Road, Ennis, 24 units (AHB)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€1,480,770.00	2023	€2,189,777.00	Completed
Limerick Road, Ennis, 18 units (AHB)	Voluntary housing (CALF)	€0.00	€0.00	€1,268,356.00	2023	€1,786,756.00	Completed
Derg View, Scarriff (4 units)	Voluntary housing (CAS)	€0.00	€0.00	€721,906.50	2023	€735,000.00	Completed
70 O Connell Street	Turnkey social housing	€0.00	€0.00	€2,001,214.00	2023	€2,852,386.50	completed
Recreation & Amenity							
Loop Head Lighthouse Visitor Centre	Upgrade works to the Visitor Centre plus provision of Watermain and conservation of Semi-detached						RRDF 1 Funded Project
and enabling works.	cottages.	€0.00	€0.00	€330,505.43	2023	€1,252,754.52	Completed
Vandeleur Walled Garden and Visitor	Refurbishment to the Stable block building,						RRDF 1 Funded Project
Centre.	associated works and car park resurfacing.	€0.00	€0.00	€766,330.85	2023	€2,924,262.40	Completed
	Design Plan to provide a Visitor Centre and						RRDF 2 Funded Project Completed. Design to be submitted to An Bord Pleanala in
Inis Cealtra Design Works	upgrade works to the Island and surrounds.	€0.00	€0.00	€158,677.34	2023	€1,115,487.97	September 2024
Totals		€ -	€ -	€11,689,173.26		€17,817,837.53	

