



COMHAIRLE CONTAE AN CHLÁIR
CLARE COUNTY COUNCIL



Quality Assurance Report for 2022

Submitted to the National
Oversight Audit Commission
(NOAC) in compliance with the
Public Spending Code

May 2023

Contents

Details	Page No.
1. Introduction	2
2. Inventory of projects & programmes	3
3. Published summary of procurements > €10m.	5
4. Assessment of compliance	5
5. Summary of in-depth checks	6
6. Conclusion	8
Appendix A: Checklists 1 to 7	9
Appendix B: In-depth reviews	17
Appendix C: Inventories of projects & programmes above €0.5m	40

Introduction

The primary aim of the Public Spending Code (PSC) Quality Assurance process is to gauge the extent to which the Council is meeting the obligations outlined in the Code. The Council is a 'sponsoring agency' under the Code, having primary responsibility for evaluating, planning and managing public investment within the parameters of the Code.

Details of the PSC are set out in *A Guide to Evaluating, Planning and Managing Public Investment*, December 2019 and can be found on the website <http://publicspendingcode.per.gov.ie>. The Code was revised in certain respects in 2019 and the revisions came into effect in January 2020. The revised code comprises a suite of guidance documents which sets out six stages in the lifecycle of a project: strategic assessment, preliminary business case, final business case including design, procurement strategy and tendering, implementation, review and ex-post evaluation. The PSC was written with Government Departments in mind, but there is sectoral guidance¹ agreed between DPER and the Local Government sector and this report has been compiled in line with that sectoral guidance.

Clare County Council has completed this year's Quality Assurance (QA) report as part of its ongoing compliance with the PSC which reports on the five steps as outlined below. This in-depth review had found that the council is broadly compliant with the code.

The Quality Assurance Process contains five steps:

- 1.** Draw up inventories (lists) of all projects/programmes at different stages of the project life cycle in the subject reporting year which have a total project life cost in excess of €0.5m.
- 2.** Publish summary information on the Council website of all single procurements in excess of €10m that occurred in the year.
- 3.** Complete seven checklists provided in the PSC Quality Assurance document.
- 4.** Carry out a more in-depth check on a small number of selected projects/programmes. The check must represent a minimum of 5% of capital and 1% of current expenditure over a rolling three-year period.
- 5.** Complete a short report for the National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC) which arises from the completion of the prior steps as outlined. This report satisfies this step for Clare County Council for 2022.

¹ Version 4, issued April 2022

Step 1 - Inventory of Projects/Programmes

The 2022 inventory is summarised below, by numbers of projects and by value. Detailed Inventory list of all expenditure which exceeds €0.5m, at each of the three stages of the project life cycle are set out in Appendix C. It captures both revenue and capital expenditure and over the lifecycle:

- being considered;
- being incurred;
- recently completed.

	Current expenditure	Capital expenditure	
Project numbers			Totals
Expenditure being considered	8	27	35
Expenditure being incurred	39	25	64
Expenditure discontinued	0	16	16
Totals	47	68	115

	Current expenditure €	Capital expenditure €	€
Project total values			Totals
Expenditure being considered	9,241,672.00	103,199,873.00	112,441,545.00
Expenditure being incurred	86,163,680.00	160,118,042.00	246,281,722.00
Expenditure completed or discontinued	0	83,699,522.00	83,699,522.00
Totals	95,405,352.00	347,017,437.00	442,422,789.00

A note on current expenditure being considered.

In accordance with the code, if a current budget increase between 2022 and 2023 exceeds €0.5m, the increase is reported as expenditure being considered. The value of such increases in this report is €9,241,672.00, comprising eight items:

- €567,598.00 increase on Maintenance/Improvement of LA Housing Units (A01)
- €2,407,461.00 increase on RAS and Leasing (A07)
- €2,721,718.00 increase on Local Road – Maintenance and Improvement (B04)
- €524,341.00 increase on Public Lighting (B05)
- €983,296.00 increase on Community and Enterprise (D06)

- €677,690.00 increase on Economic Development and Promotion (D09)
- €747,382.00 Increase on Operation of Fire Service (E11)
- €612,716.00 increase on Operation of Library & Archival Service (F02)

Maintenance of LA Housing Units, the reasons for the increased provision include;

- Increased match funding for Vacant Homes grant allocations. Reducing level of contribution from the Department towards Vacant Houses
- Increase in Housing stock numbers with corresponding maintenance budget increase.
- Increase in Housing stock numbers with corresponding Local property Charges
- Increased number of maintenance calls
- Increase in building costs (materials and labour)

RAS (Rental Accommodation Scheme) and Leasing

- Budgets have increased due to the rise in the number of Approved Housing Body properties which were provided (including Mortgage to Rent).

Local Road – Maintenance and Improvement

- Additional Grant Allocation in Budget 2023.

Public Lighting

- Additional budget funding was provided to cover increased energy costs.

Economic Development and Promotion

- The increase arose from an additional economic initiative for Ennis 2040 strategy.

Community and Enterprise function

- The increase in popularity of the Digital Hubs through the DigiClare initiative has resulted in an increase in bookings and footfall particularly with remote working.

Operation of Fire Service

- National Pay agreements, Payments to other fire authorities increase, energy increases, Salaries, Communications Code and Training

Operation of Library & Archival Service

- Main drivers include Energy costs, National Pay agreements impacting on Salaries and Wages costs.

Step 2 - Summary of Single Procurements in excess of €10m

The PSC Quality Assurance process requires all councils to publish all individual procurements in excess of €10m on their website. In 2022, in Clare County Council there was one procurement in excess of €10m. In accordance with the requirement under the PSC to publish such procurements, the following is the location for the publication on the Council's website <https://www.clarecoco.ie/services/business/procurement>.

Step 3 - Assessment of Compliance

The third step in the quality assurance process involves completing a set of checklists covering all expenditure. There are seven checklists in total, and in all, 82 questions are asked, aligned to the expenditure inventory/expenditure type, as tabulated below:

Checklists to be completed aligned with inventory	
Expenditure type	Checklist that applies
	Checklist 1 for General obligations, not specific to individual expenditure items
Expenditure being considered	Checklist 2 for Capital projects or capital grant schemes being considered Checklist 3 for Current expenditure being considered
Expenditure being incurred	Checklist 4 for Capital expenditure being incurred Checklist 5 for Current expenditure being Incurred
Expenditure discontinued	Checklist 6 for Capital expenditure completed Checklist 7 for Current expenditure completed

Compliance with the questions on each checklist is done by rating the compliance level, where a rating 1 signifies 'scope for significant improvement', 2 signifies 'compliant but with some improvement necessary', and 3 signifies 'broadly compliant'. One scored set of checklists representing the Council overall was compiled from multiple sample contributions from across the organisation. The compiled checklists are set out in Appendix A.

Compliance assessment from Checklist Assessments

Across checklists 1 to 6, Clare County Council is broadly compliant.

Considerable liaison with and oversight by Approving Authorities applies to capital projects, upon which funding drawdown relies. Checklist 7 concerns current expenditure discontinued.

Step 4 - In-Depth Checks

The PSC quality assurance requires this Council to carry out an in-depth check of projects amounting to a minimum 5% per annum for capital expenditure over a rolling three-year period, and 1% per annum for current expenditure, similarly. The report for 2022 marks the first year of a rolling three years (2022-2024) for the purposes of the in-depth quality assurance check. Two capital projects and one current programme were subject to an in-depth check for this report. The Internal Audit unit of the Council was tasked with carrying out this step.

Required: in-depth check must average 5% per annum for capital expenditure over 3 years. 2022 is year 1.

Required: in-depth check must average 1% per annum for current expenditure over 3 years. 2022 is year 1

	Current - total on inventory in the year	value of project or programme reviewed in depth	% in depth reviewed in the year	Stage of expenditure in-depth checked
2022	95,405,352.00	€2,324,065.00	2.43%	current being incurred
2023				
2024				
		total average % checked		
		average % over the three years	2022 is year 1	
	Capital - total on inventory in the year	value of project or programme reviewed in depth	% in depth reviewed in the year	
2022	347,017,437.00	€13,663,623.00	3.93%	capital being incurred, and capital being completed
2023				
2024				
		total average % checked		
		average % over the three years	2022 is year 1	

In-Depth Checks – Summary

The in-depth checks were completed on a Housing Development in Ashline, Ennis recently completed, Vandeleur Walled Gardens (Phase I) under construction and the Civic Amenity Sites operations were checked for this report. Appendix B of this report sets out more detail.

5.1 - Housing Development in Ashline, Ennis – Capital Expenditure – completed

This housing development comprised of the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses. The development was a €10 million development across a range of housing units.

A post project review has been completed and the findings were that that the PSC was complied with.

For further housing developments the following issues should be considered:

- Investigate if Inspection software programme could be used to keep track of Consultant inspection reports and dates for future housing developments
- In future dwelling design include wet rooms and adjustable space heating temperature controls
- A Ground Penetrating Radar Survey should be carried out in advance to identify unknown underground cables / ducting
- More Site Investigation to ensure a more Robust Requirement package
- Earlier agreement with utility providers including Irish Water and ESB to assess a connection application
- Final BER to be included in contract documents
- Internal heat pumps to be located on the ground floor

5.2 - Vandeleur Walled Gardens (Phase I) - under construction

This project is for the refurbishment of a historic walled garden and stable block supported under the Rural Regeneration Development Fund.

Vandeleur Walled Gardens is situated approximately 2 kilometres from the town of Kilrush on the R473 Killimer Road (car ferry). The development of tourist accommodation is in line with the Clare County Development Plan 2017 – 2023 has a number of strategic aims including maximising the potential of tourism as a ‘pillar of economic growth’ thereby contributing to the balanced economic development of the County and the tourism industry of the region and working in partnership with Fáilte Ireland, Clare Tourism Forum and other agencies to define the tourist experience and to develop a clear tourism identity for County Clare and realises opportunity for Marine Tourism, Leisure and Recreation.

This project objective will increase the scale of the existing community and tourism product that Vandeleur Walled Gardens currently offers. This is Phase 1 of the development and will benefit from a Post Project Review when complete and lessons learned can be used in Phase 2 (Café relocation).

5.3 Civic Amenity Sites – Current Expenditure being incurred

The Civic Amenity Sites is an annual ongoing expenditure programme for Clare County Council, a value in 2022 of €2,324,065. Clare County Council has five Civic Amenity Sites (CAS) in total across the county, Ballyduffbeg Inagh (BDB), Ennis, Lisdeen, Scariff & Shannon. Ennis and Shannon have recycling facilities only.

Following the in depth review, It is the opinion of Internal Audit that Clare County Council is in

reasonable compliance with the standards of the Public Spending Code in respect of its responsibilities for the Civic Amenity Sites in 2022.

The budget for the Civic Amenity Sites is included in the overall Annual Budget and is part of the Council's overall budgetary process. The Budget is monitored and managed appropriately.

6. Conclusion

Clare County Council notes that the Public Spending Code has been reviewed nationally and the revisions came into effect on 1 January 2020. The Quality Assurance process of the code has not substantially changed.

Across the types of expenditure and over the expenditure lifecycle, it is considered that the Council is broadly compliant with the code, as shown in the checklists. Three expenditure areas were subject to in-depth checks for this report: current expenditure on the Civic Amenity Sites and capital expenditure on the Housing Development in Ashline, Ennis and Vandelur Walled Gardens, Kilrush. All were found to be broadly compliant with the Public Spending Code.

The updates to the Public Spending Code present an opportunity and rationale for sectoral training roll out to Local Authority project managers. Clare County Council would welcome such refresher training.

CLARE COUNTY COUNCIL

Self-Assessment Checklists 1 to 7

Checklist 1 – To be completed in respect of general obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes.

General Obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Discussion/Action Required
1.1 Does the organisation ensure, on an ongoing basis, that appropriate people within the organisation and its agencies are aware of their requirements of the PSC (incl. through training)?	2	Yes, relevant staff are notified of their obligations under the PSC, via Project Management training, liaison with Government funding departments and via internal processes concerning business case approval requirements by Management Team for new Capital Projects. Further roll out of training on the revised PSC requirements to the Local Government sector is anticipated and welcomed.
1.2 Has internal training on the PSC been provided to relevant staff?	2	In-house briefing sessions have been provided to relevant staff. Project Management training has been rolled out to Project Managers. Some staff participated in training by DPER in Galway in June 2016. No DPER training has been provided since 2016. Further roll out of training on the revised PSC requirements to the Local Government sector is anticipated and welcomed.
1.3 Has the PSC been adapted for the type of project/programme that your organisation is responsible for? i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed?	2	Yes. A guidance document has been developed for the PSC QA process, adapted to Local Government structures and approach. A revised document issued in February 2021 (v4).
1.4 Has the organisation in its role as Approving Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the PSC?	N/A	
1.5 Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot checks) been disseminated, where appropriate, within the organisation and to agencies?	2	Yes, previous recommendations have been submitted to the relevant sections where in-depth checks have taken place for Capital and Current Expenditure.
1.6 Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon?	2	Follow up audits would be required to verify that recommendations have been acted upon.
1.7 Has an annual PSC QA report been certified by the organisation Chief Executive, submitted to NOAC and published on the organisation's website?	3	Yes.
1.8 Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP?	2	The required samples of both Current and Capital spending will be reviewed over the 3-year period
1.9 Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations? Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability of the project.	1	No
1.10 How many formal evaluations have been completed in the year under review? Have they been published in a timely manner?	1	None.
1.11 Is there a process to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations?	1	
1.12 How have the recommendations of reviews and ex-post evaluations informed resource allocation decisions?	2	The relevant sections have been informed of what recommendations they should consider for future projects.

Checklist 2 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes that were under consideration in the past year

Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
2.1 Was a strategic assessment report (SAR) completed for all capital projects and programmes over €10m?	N/A	
2.2 Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	2	Yes, in conjunction with the relevant government department, i.e. approving authority.
2.3 Was a preliminary and final business case, including appropriate financial and economic appraisal, completed for all capital projects and programmes?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.4 Were the proposal objectives SMART and aligned with government policy including National Planning Framework, Climate Migration Plan, etc?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.5 Was an appropriate appraisal method and parameters used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.6 Was a financial appraisal carried out on all proposals and was there appropriate consideration of affordability?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.7 Was the appraisal process commenced at an early enough stage to inform decision making?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.8 Were sufficient options analysed in the business case for each capital proposal?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.9 Was the evidence base for the estimated cost set out in each business case? Was an appropriate methodology used to estimate the cost? Were appropriate budget contingencies put in place?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.10 Was risk considered and a risk mitigation strategy commenced? Was appropriate consideration given to governance and deliverability?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.11 Were the strategic assessment report, preliminary and final business case submitted to DPER for technical review for projects estimated to cost over €100m.	N/A	N/A in 2022
2.12 Was a detailed project brief including design brief and procurement strategy prepared for all investment projects?	2	Yes, where applicable
2.13 Were procurement rules (both national and EU) complied with?	3	Yes
2.14 Was the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) properly implemented?	3	Yes
2.15 Were State Aid rules checked for all support?	N/A	
2.16 Was approval sought from the Approving Authority at all decision gates?	3	Yes
2.17 Was Value for Money assessed and confirmed at each decision gate by Sponsoring Agency and Approving Authority?	3	Yes
2.18 Was approval sought from government through a Memorandum for Government at the appropriate decision gates for projects estimated to cost over €100m?	N/A	N/A in 2022

Checklist 3 – To be completed in respect of new current expenditure under consideration in the past year.

Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
3.1 Were objectives clearly set out?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.2 Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.3 Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal, prepared for new current expenditure?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.4 Was an appropriate appraisal method used?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category inventory
3.5 Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years?	N/A	The items falling into this category are ongoing essential functions, ie maintenance and improvement of LA housing and Roads network
3.6 Did the business case include a section on piloting?	N/A	See above
3.7 Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m?	N/A	See above
3.8 Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme?	N/A	See above
3.9 Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Vote Section in DPER?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.10 Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.11 Was the required approval granted?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.12 Has a sunset clause been set?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.13 If outsourcing was involved, were procurement rules complied with?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.14 Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category
3.15 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	N/A	No expenditure in the inventory comes under this category

Checklist 4 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grants schemes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

Incurring Capital Expenditure	Self- Assessed Compliance Rating: 1- 3	Comment/Action Required
4.1 Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval given at each Decision Gate?	2	
4.2 Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?	2	Yes, relevant teams within Departments met on a regular basis.
4.3 Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?	3	All capital programmes are managed by programme coordinators at a suitably senior level.
4.4 Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project?	3	All capital programmes are managed by project managers at a suitably senior level.
4.5 Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?	3	Project reports regularly prepared in most cases and Elected Members/Members of the public are informed by the monthly Chief Executive Report
4.6 Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule?	2	Where budget over-runs occur, documented explanations are available in progress reports and final reports and sanction from the Approving agency is obtained.
4.7 Did budgets have to be adjusted?	2	Yes, with Departmental approval
4.8 Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly?	2	Yes
4.9 Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case incl. CBA/CEA? (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.)	N/A	
4.10 If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/ programme, grant scheme was the project subjected to adequate examination?	N/A	
4.11 If costs increased or there were other significant changes to the project, was approval received from the Approving Authority?	3	Yes, Sanctioning Authority approved increased costs
4.12 Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of Deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?	N/A	No

Checklist 5 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

Incurring Current Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 -3	Comment/Action Required
5.1 Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?	3	Yes. Spending programmes defined as part of the annual budget process.
5.2 Are outputs well defined?	3	National Key Performance Indicators are in place for Local Government
5.3 Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?	3	Key Performance Indicators are established each year for specific services. Service delivery plans are reviewed periodically. Regular management and progress meetings and implementation of PMDS are examples of monitoring efficiency tools used. Annual reports and Departmental returns also.
5.4 Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an ongoing basis?	3	Yes, budget performance and monitoring is in place, as above. Annual reports and Departmental returns are made. Audits also occur.
5.5 Are outcomes well defined?	3	Annual Service Delivery Plans enhance this measurement. Also, Corporate Plans, Annual Budget, Annual Report, County Development Plan, meetings with the Department.
5.6 Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?	2	Annual Service Delivery Plans enhance this measurement. Also, Annual Reports and Quarterly Financial Reporting
5.7 Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?	3	The Council complies with National Key Performance Indicators in relation to cost per unit and costing is also carried out by service.
5.8 Are other data compiled to monitor performance?	3	Yes, Data compiled in each service area, monthly expenditure monitoring, Annual Budget and AFS processes facilitate monitoring.
5.9 Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an ongoing basis?	2	Yes. All expenditure is evaluated annually across these service levels as part of the Budget process and Annual Reports, Quarterly Financial Reporting and the monthly Chief Executive Report.
5.10 Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' ¹ of programmes/projects?	2	The Council has co-operated in all the VFM studies and subsequent progress reviews issued by the Department's VFM unit. Under 'other evaluations' there was LGAS review. Customer surveys and external assessments are also done on occasion.

¹ Evaluation proofing involves checking to see if the required data are being collected so that when the time comes a programme/project can be subjected to a robust evaluation. If the data are not being collected, then a plan should be put in place to collect the appropriate indicators to allow for the completion of a robust evaluation down the line.

Checklist 6 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes discontinued in the year under review.

Capital Expenditure Recently Completed	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
6.1 How many project completion reports were completed in the year under review?	2	Two project completion reports were completed in 2022 by the Housing Department
6.2 Were lessons learned from Project Completion Reports incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	2	Staff involved in projects noted lessons learned for incorporation into future projects.
6.3 How many Project Completion Reports were published in the year under review?	1	None
6.4 How many Ex-Post Evaluations were completed in the year under review?	1	None
6.5 How many Ex-Post Evaluations were published in the year under review?	1	None
6.6 Were lessons learned from Ex-Post Evaluations incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	N/A	
6.7 Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluations carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	2	Project managers in the Housing Department complete Project Completion Reports and these reports are reviewed by the relevant Government Department
6.8 Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluation Reports for projects over €50m sent to DPER for dissemination?	N/A	

Checklist 7 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued.

Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
7.1 Were reviews carried out of current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022
7.2 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022
7.3 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022
7.4 Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022
7.5 Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022
7.6 Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022
7.7 Were changes made to the organisation's practices in light of lessons learned from reviews?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2022

APPENDIX B

In-depth reviews

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check for 2022

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme Information	
Name	40 Social Housing Units
Detail	Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis
Responsible Body	Clare County Council
Current Status	This project is complete
Start Date	August 2020
End Date	June 2022
Overall Cost	€10,937,648

Project Description

This housing development comprised of the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses. The 40 No. units consist of 13 no. 2-bedroom two-storey terraced and semi-detached dwellings, 17 no. 3-bedroom two-storey terraced and semi-detached dwellings, 2 no. 4-bedroom two-storey terraced and semi-detached dwellings, 2 no. 2-bedroom single-storey terraced and detached bungalows, 1 no. 4 bedroom single-storey detached bungalow, 3 no. 3-bedroom two-storey terraced, semi-detached and detached dwellings, 2 no. 2-bedroom single-storey terraced bungalows.

The scheme is a mix of 2 storey terraced, 2 storey semi-detached units, 2 storey detached, single storey terraced & single storey detached units. The project was designed and developed by EML Architects on behalf of Clare County Council.

The new social housing development at Cnoc na Scoile is located 3 kilometres from the town centre. In addition, Ennis National School is located a quarter of a kilometre from the new housing development. The school has an autistic unit and on site creche. Within walking distance there is a supermarket, 24-hour petrol/diesel station, car dealership, toy store and St Flannans College, Ennis which is the largest secondary school in the county.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Ashline turnkey social housing scheme, Ennis (capital expenditure 'being incurred') has been prepared. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on it is available in the [Public Spending Code](#).

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
<p>The objective of this project was to provide a good standard of living accommodation for individuals on the Local Authority housing list</p>	<p>The primary input to the project is the Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage funding under Rebuilding Ireland Programme</p> <p>Council personnel at the Design Team, Housing Department, Clare County Council</p> <p>Quantity Surveyors – Tom McNamara & Partners</p> <p>Contractor – M Fitzgibbon Contractors Ltd</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Architects – EML Architects <p>Civil & Structural Engineering – P Coleman & Associates</p> <p>Mechanical & Electrical Services – Matt O’Mahony & Associates Ltd</p>	<p>Approval of Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage under Rebuilding Ireland Programme to proceed with the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis.</p> <p>Advertisement on OJEU pre-qualification tender.</p> <p>Receipt and Evaluation of Proposals</p>	<p>The delivery of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis</p>	<p>The availability of a supply of social housing units to meet the demand in the area where a need has been identified</p>

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objective of this project was to provide a good standard of living accommodation for individuals on the Local Authority Housing List.

Inputs:

- The primary input to the project is the funding from the Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage under Rebuilding Ireland Programme
- Council personnel at the Design Team, Housing Department, Clare County Council
- Quantity Surveyors – Tom McNamara & Partners
- Contractor – M Fitzgibbon Contractors Ltd
- Architects – EML Architects
- Civil & Structural Engineering – P Coleman & Associates
- Mechanical & Electrical Services – Matt O’Mahony & Associates Ltd

Activities:

- Advertisement on OJEU pre-qualification tender
- Receipt and Evaluation of Proposals
- Approval of Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage under Rebuilding Ireland Programme to proceed with the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis

Outputs:

The delivery of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis

Outcomes:

The availability of a supply of social housing units to meet the demand in the area where a need has been identified

Section B – Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones:

April 2018	External appointment of Designer, Architectural Services, Civil & Structural Engineering, Mechanical & Electrical Services following Evaluation of Tenders
July 2019	Planning permission granted by Clare County Council for the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline
August 2019	Advertisement on E Tenders for Building Construction Work
July 2020	Approval received from DHLG&H for the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis
August 2020	Appointment of contractor and Construction commenced on site on the 24 th of

	August
June 2022	Delivery of housing units as construction is completed and a Certificate of Substantial Completion issued to the contractor on the 2 nd of June
July 2022	Final Accounts Report
October 2022	Post Project Review Report

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to social housing scheme project.

Project/Programme Key Documents		
	<i>Title</i>	<i>Details</i>
1	Executive Orders	Appointment of contractor for the housing development
2	CE Orders 1047 & 1048	Appointment of Design Team Consultants - Architect & Civil Structural Engineer
3	Planning Permission	Resolution from Clare County Council on the 8 th of July 2019 of approval of Part 8 planning application – Reference Number 198005
4	Advertisement on e-Tenders	Advertisement on e-tenders for building construction work
5	Evaluation of Tenders	Clare County Council evaluated all tenders that were returned
6	Approval of Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage	Approval notification dated 10 th of July 2020
7	Final Accounts Report	Prepared by the Quantity Surveyor regarding the tendered amount and the final account to be paid to the contractor
8	Post Project Review	Reviewing the Value Management Strategies, Budget/Cost and key experiences and lessons learned

Key Documents 1 – Executive Orders 29285, 29286, 29287, 29288, 28289 & 28290 – Appointment of Professional Services

29285	Appoint and accept tender for Quantity Surveying services by Tom McNamara & Partners
29286	Appoint and accept tender for Mechanical & Electrical services by Matt O’Mahony & Associates Ltd
29287	Appoint and accept tender for Project Supervisor Design Process (PSDP) and Designer for Housing by EML Architects Ltd
29288	Appoint and accept tender of Designer for Housing in accordance with the Safety, Health & Welfare at work (Construction) Regulations 2013 by Tom McNamara & Partners
29289	Appoint and accept tender for Civil & Structural Engineering services by P Coleman & Associates

29290	Appoint and accept tender for Mechanical & Electrical services in accordance with the Safety, Health & Welfare at work (Construction) Regulations 2013 by Matt O’Mahony & Associates Ltd
-------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

All of the above Chief Executive Orders dated the 30th of April 2018.

Key Document 2 – Appointment of Design Team Consultants

Chief Executive Orders 1047 & 1048 dated 30th of April 2018 for the appointment of Architect & Civil Structural Engineer.

Key Document 3 – Planning approval

The planning application was submitted to Clare County Council’s Planning Department on 9th of May 2019. It was brought before the Council meeting on the 8th of July 2019. It was agreed that pursuant to Part XI, Section 179 of the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended) and Part VIII, Article 80 and 81 of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001 – 2010, Clare County Council proceed with the proposed construction of 40 dwelling houses at Ashline, Ennis, Co Clare. The resolution was signed by the Senior Executive Officer in Corporate Services and the Cathaoirleach of Clare County Council.

Key Document 4 – Advertisement on e-Tenders

Advertisement on eTenders for a Works Contractor and PSCS (Project Supervisor Construction Stage) for the Housing development at Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis on 15th of August 2019 under the following codes:

- Building Construction Work
- Construction work for multiple dwelling buildings and individual homes
- Construction work for houses
- Multi-dwelling buildings construction work

A response date of 20th of September 2019 was given.

Key Document 5 – Evaluation of Tenders

Clare County Council appointed a Design Team to develop and deliver the scheme. Following an OJEU Prequalification Process, from which eight contractors were shortlisted, tenders were invited by Clare County Council on the 21st of January 2020. Five tenders were returned on the 10th of March.

Key Document 6 – Approval letter

Stage 4 Approval letter from the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government for €10,534,481 (incl. VAT). Department Ref: N3/2/273.

Key Document 7 – Final Accounts Report

This report was prepared by the Quantity Surveyor, Tom McNamara & Partners containing the contract sum and approved change orders and agreed final account owed to the contractor M Fitzgibbon Contractors Ltd excluding VAT on the 8th of July 2022.

Key Document 8 – Post Project Review

This report was produced in October 2022 in line with the template attached to the CWMF Guidance Note 4.1 by the Housing Development.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit carried out for this check. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Appointment of Design Team Consultants	To confirm the appointment of the Design Team Consultants for the project	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council
Planning Application	To confirm that Planning Permission was applied for	Available on Clare County Council's website
Advertisement in eTenders	To evaluate compliance with the Public Spending Code requirements for Capital Projects in relation to public procurement procedures	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council
Evaluation of Tenders	To evaluate compliance with the Public Spending Code requirements for Capital Projects in relation to public procurement procedures	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council
Approval of DHLG&H	To confirm Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage under Rebuilding Ireland Programme for the construction of 40 housing units at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council
Executive Orders: 29285, 29286, 29287, 29288, 28289 & 28290	To confirm the appointment of Professional Services for the project	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council
Final Accounts Reports	It is prepared at the completion of the construction phase of a project and brings together all the financial aspects of a project into one single document.	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council
Post Project Review	Prepared by the Housing Capital Department in Clare County Council to outline key experiences and lessons learned from the project	Available and held in Housing department of Clare County Council

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to all stages of this project is available on file.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project comply with the standards set out in the PSC? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

All data appropriate to all stages of this project is available on file.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All data appropriate to all stages of this project is available on file including a Post Project review.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

For further housing developments the following issues should be considered:

- Investigate if Inspection software programme could be used to keep track of Consultant inspection reports and dates for future housing developments
- In future dwelling design include wet rooms and adjustable space heating temperature controls
- A Ground Penetrating Radar Survey should be carried out in advance to identify unknown underground cables / ducting
- More Site Investigation to ensure a more Robust Requirement package
- Earlier agreement with utility providers including Irish Water and ESB to assess a connection application
- Final BER to be included in contract documents
- Internal heat pumps to be located on the ground floor

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this in-depth check on the construction of 40 No. dwelling houses at Cnoc na Scoile, Ashline, Kilrush Road, Ennis.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project documentation for all stages of this project provides reasonable assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed include:

- Advertisement on e-Tenders
 - Evaluation of Tenders
 - Approval of DHLG&H
 - Chief Executive Orders
 - Final Account Reports
 - Post Project Review
-
-

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check for 2022

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme Information	
Name	Vandeleur Walled Gardens
Detail	Refurbishment of Derelict Protected Structure including a new build garden facilities building and associated works (Phase 1)
Responsible Body	Clare County Council
Current Status	This project is in Progress
Start Date	January 2021
End Date	June 2023
Overall Cost	€2,725,975

Project Description

Vandeleur Walled Gardens is situated approximately 2 kilometres from the town of Kilrush on the R473 Killimer Road (car ferry) and is perfectly located along the Wild Atlantic Way. Kilrush Town has a population of 3,000 people and there is a need for a community facility for families both young and old. Kilrush town has suffered due to the economic recession which has led to an increase in unemployment and increasing numbers on social housing lists, therefore it will create opportunities for economic growth and employment in the region.

The development of tourist accommodation is in line with the Clare County Development Plan 2017 – 2023 has a number of strategic aims including maximising the potential of tourism as a ‘pillar of economic growth’ thereby contributing to the balanced economic development of the County and the tourism industry of the region and working in partnership with Fáilte Ireland, Clare Tourism Forum and other agencies to define the tourist experience and to develop a clear tourism identity for County Clare.

This project also aligns to the objectives of the Clare Tourism Strategy as the 2030 vision is for Clare to be a globally renowned, sustainable and vibrant destination that is easily reached and traversed, and recognised for its rich cultural assets, its stunning and open-space landscapes, its compelling array of remarkable experiences and for its welcome and exceptional hospitality.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Kilrush (capital expenditure 'being incurred') has been prepared. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on it is available in the [Public Spending Code](#).

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
<p>Refurbishment of Derelict Protected Structure including a new build garden facilities and associated works.</p>	<p>To ensure protection of the built heritage and renovation of derelict built heritage at Vandeleur Estate</p> <p>Council personnel from the Rural Development, Clare County Council</p> <p>Contractor – Custy Contractors Ltd</p> <p>Architectural Services & Civil Engineering - P Coleman & Associates</p> <p>Quantity Surveyors – Rogerson Reddan</p> <p>Designer (Interpretative Design) – Makedot Ltd</p> <p>Environmental Consultancy – Minogue & Associates</p> <p>Mechanical & Electrical - Moloney Fox Consulting</p>	<p>The project is funded by the Rural Regeneration and Development Fund, Project Ireland 2040 under the Department of Rural and Community Development</p> <p>Pre-approved match funding of approx. €600,000 from Clare County Council</p> <p>Advertisement on eTenders</p> <p>Appointed after mini competition from Framework</p>	<p>Completion of the Refurbishment of Derelict Protected Structure including a new build garden facilities and associated works.</p>	<p>The development of Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Vandeleur Estate, Kilrush</p>

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: Refurbishment of Derelict Protected Structure including a new build garden facilities building and associated works

Inputs:

- To ensure protection of the built heritage and renovation of derelict built heritage at Vandeleur Estate
- Council personnel from the Rural Development, Clare County Council
- Contractor – Custy Contractors Ltd
- Architectural Services & Civil Engineering - P Coleman & Associates
- Quantity Surveyors – Rogerson Reddan
- Designer (Interpretative Design) – Makedot Ltd
- Environmental Consultancy – Minogue & Associates
- Mechanical & Electrical - Moloney Fox Consulting

Activities:

- The project is funded by the Rural Regeneration and Development Fund, Project Ireland 2040 under the Department of Rural and Community Development - €1,975,819
- Pre-approved match funding of approx. €600,000 from Clare County Council
- Advertisement on eTenders
- Appointed after mini competition from Framework

Outputs:

To ensure protection of the built heritage and renovation of derelict built heritage at Vandeleur Estate

Outcomes:

The development of Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Vandeleur Estate, Kilrush

Section B – Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the development of Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Vandeleur Estate, Kilrush from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones:

May 2012	Part 8 Planning Permission granted
September 2019	Advertisement on e-Tenders
Feb 2020	Approval received from DRCD for Vandeleur Walled Gardens
October 2020	Evaluation of Tenders
Dec 2019 – Feb 2022	Appointment of Professional Services
January 2020	Construction work commenced

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating Vandeleur Walled Gardens project.

Project/Programme Key Documents		
	<i>Title</i>	<i>Details</i>
1	Planning Permission	Resolution from Clare County Council in 2012 of approval of Part 8 planning application – Reference Number P01-31012
2	Advertisement on e-Tenders	Published Notices on eTenders
3	Department Approval	Approval from the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government for €1,975,819 (incl. VAT)
4	Evaluation of Tenders	Clare County Council evaluated all tenders that were returned
5	Chief Executive Orders	Appointment of Professional Services

Key Document 1 – Planning Permission

The planning application was submitted to Clare County Council's Planning Department in 2011, Planning reference no P01/31012. It was brought before the Council meeting in 2012. It was agreed that pursuant to Part XI, Section 179 of the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended) and Part VIII, Article 80 and 81 of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001 – 2010, Clare County Council proceed with the application for permission to restore and make alterations to existing stable block to accommodate museum, crafts and ancillary service buildings with minor alterations to pedestrian and vehicle circulation and to construct a garden maintenance/service building. The stable block is a protected structure Ref K27 and sits within the demense of Kilrush House/Vandeleur Estate Ref K22 as noted in the Kilrush Development Plan 2008 – 2014 at Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Feagarroge, Kilimer

There is also a letter dated 11th of February 2022 from the Planning Department confirming that there is no expiry of the Part VIII permission. Completion of the works at a future date is considered acceptable to the Planning Authority.

Key Document 2 – Advertisement on e-Tenders

Advertisement on eTenders for Services for Restoration, alteration of the existing stable block to shop, museum, visitor experience with new gardening building and accommodation under the following codes:

- Architectural and related services
- Exhibition centre construction work
- Buildings of particular historical or architectural interest
- Architectural, construction, engineering and inspection services
- Architectural design services
- Architectural services for outdoor areas

Health and safety services
 Technical services
 Urban planning and landscape architectural services
 Landscape architectural services
 Construction-site supervision services

A response date of 10th of October 2019 was given

Key Document 3– Department Approval

Approval from the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government for €1,975,819 (incl. VAT).

Key Document 4 – Evaluation of Tenders

Five tenders were returned by the closing date. Tender clarifications were issued via email to Jada Projects Ltd. on 30th October 2020 to review their tender and to confirm if they were satisfied with their submitted tender price. Jada Projects Ltd. responded by email on 4th November 2020, confirming that they wished to withdraw their tender.

Key Documents 5 – Chief Executive Orders– Appointment of Professional Services

RD137	6/12/2019	Appoint and accept tender for Visitor Experience Consultancy services by John Ruddle
RD138	12/12/2019	Appoint and accept tender for Mechanical & Electrical Experience Consulting services by Moloney Fox Consultancy
RD143 (a)	16/12/2019	Appoint and accept tender for Quantity Surveying services by Rogerson Reddan
RD145	17/12/2019	Appoint and accept tender for Architectural services by P Coleman & Associates
RD146	12/12/2019	Appoint and accept tender for Civil & Structural Engineering services by P Coleman & Associates
RD164	24/2/2020	Appoint and accept tender for Clean out Works by PJ Meaney Construction Ltd
RD200	8/8/2020	Appoint and accept tender for Construction Works by Custy Construction Ltd
RD211	30/3/2021	Appoint and accept Designer by Makedot Ltd in the Safety, Health and Welfare Act at Work (Construction) Regulations 2013
RD212	30/3/2021	Appoint and accept tender for Interpretive Design & Installation by

		Makedot Ltd
RD309	14/12/2022	Appoint and accept tender for carrying out alterations and refurbishment works in the existing café by Gatecastle Construction Ltd
RD324	22/2/2023	Appoint and accept tender for Environmental Consultancy Services by Ruth Minogue and Associates

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit carried out for this check. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Appointment of Design Team Consultants	To confirm the appointment of the Design Team Consultants for the project	Available and held in Rural Development department of Clare County Council
Planning Application	To confirm that Planning Permission was applied for	Available on Clare County Council's website
Advertisement in etenders	To evaluate compliance with the Public Spending Code requirements for Capital Projects in relation to public procurement procedures	Available and held in Rural Development department of Clare County Council
Evaluation of Tenders	To evaluate compliance with the Public Spending Code requirements for Capital Projects in relation to public procurement procedures	Available and held in Rural Development department of Clare County Council
Approval of DRCD	To confirm funding from the Department of Rural and Community Development for Vandeleur Walled Gardens	Available and held in Rural Development department of Clare County Council
Chief Executive Orders	To confirm the appointment of Professional Services for the project	Available and held in Rural Development department of Clare County Council

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to all stages of this project is available on file.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Vandeleur Estate, Kilrush based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project comply with the standards set out in the PSC? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

All data appropriate to all stages of this project is available on file.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All data appropriate to all stages of this project is available on file.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

- A Post Project review should take place once Phase I has been completed (estimated June 2023).
- Lessons learned from the Post Project review should be considered in Phase 2 of the Project (Café relocation and interpretative museum) for which loan funding of €1.3m has been allowed for in the Capital budget 2023 – 2025.
- For Phase 2 of the Project as with all projects, there is always a risk of overspends and this is particularly prevalent in the current climate, with the aftermath of Covid 19 and the impact of the war in Ukraine. Internal Audit recommends that the expenditure continues to be prudently and forensically monitored and managed to ensure the best possible value for money is obtained.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this in-depth check on Vandeleur Walled Gardens, Vandeleur Estate, Kilrush.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project documentation for all stages of this project provides reasonable assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed include:

- Advertisement on e-Tenders
- Evaluation Tenders
- Approval from DRCD
- Chief Executive Orders
- Planning Permission

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

Programme or Project Information	
Name	Civic Amenity Sites
Detail	Revenue Expenditure in respect of Civic Amenity Sites
Responsible Body	Clare County Council
Current Status	Revenue Expenditure Being Incurred
Start Date	1 st January 2022
End Date	31 st December 2022
Overall Cost	€2,324,065

Project Description

Clare County Council has five Civic Amenity Sites (CAS) in total across the county, Ballyduffbeg Inagh (BDB), Ennis, Lisdeen, Scariff & Shannon. Ennis and Shannon have recycling facilities only.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Clare County Council Internal Audit unit has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Landfill and Civic Amenity Sites in 2022.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
<p>To ensure that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adequate policy and procedures are in place to ensure that all recycling material entering the site is accounted for and managed correctly • Adequate cash collection/handling controls in place • Adequate and accurate income reconciliation in place • Adequate physical and security controls are in place at the site • Adequate procedures are in place to ensure best practice. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revenue Budget for 2022 • Staff in the Landfill and Civic Amenity Sites • Engineering and Administrative Support from staff in the Environment Section • Clerical Staff from the Central Cash Office and Municipal District Offices 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Landfill and Civic Amenity Site operation and management 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Efficiently and effectively managed Landfill and Civic Amenity Sites 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Providing a high quality Civic Amenity service to the public .

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives:

To ensure that:

- Adequate policy and procedures are in place to ensure that all recycling material entering the site is accounted for and managed correctly
- Adequate cash collection and handling controls are in place
- Adequate and accurate income reconciliation are in place
- Adequate physical and security controls are in place at the site
- Adequate procedures are in place to ensure best practice

Inputs:

- Revenue Budget adopted for 2022
- Staff in the Landfill and Civic Amenity Sites
- Engineering and Administrative Support from staff in the Environment Section
- Clerical Staff from the Central Cash Office and Municipal District Offices

Activities:

- Daily Landfill and Civic Amenity Site operation and management

Outputs:

- Efficiently and Effectively managed Landfill and Civic Amenity Sites

Outcomes:

Providing a high quality Civic Amenity service to the public

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Civic Amenity Sites from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

Annual Budget	The Budget for Civic Amenity Sites 2022 was agreed at Council meeting held on 25 th November 2021.
Annual Expenditure	Expenditure of €2,324,065 incurred during 2022.
Operation of the Landfill	Operations and Management at the site.

Annual Income	Management of Income generated from activities €694,995
Reporting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual Report 2021 • Annual Service Delivery Plan • Corporate Plan 2019 – 2024 • Chief Executive Reports

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the Civic Amenity Sites work during 2022.

Project/Programme Key Documents	
Title	Details
Waste Management Legislation & Waste Management Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Waste Management Acts 1996-2010 • Waste Management Plan 2015-2022
Budget Approval 2022	Annual CCC Budget Provision
Landfill Operational Practices	Environment Procedures Manuals
Agresso Financial Management Reports	Details of expenditure, income and budget on Civic Amenity Sites Codes for 2022
Corporate Procurement Policy	Sets out the procedures for the purchase of goods, materials, and services and the delegated authorised levels for purchasing, approving and payment of grants and invoices
Environmental reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual Report 2021 • Annual Service Delivery Plan • Corporate Plan 2019 – 2024 • Chief Executive Reports

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out regarding Landfill and Civic Amenity Site operations in 2022. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The data requirements listed above are available from the Environment Section, the Corporate Affairs Department, and the Agresso Financial Management System.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the Civic Amenity Sites operations based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

This in-depth check has shown that the operation of the Landfill complies reasonably with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code. There are clear objectives for the operations of the landfill and aftercare management which are implemented and monitored.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

The necessary data and information are available from files, data and systems held in the Environment Section, and the Agresso Financial Management System to monitor landfill operation and Civic Amenity Site costs on an ongoing basis. This information can be used to monitor ongoing expenditure for the management and operation of the landfill and Civic Amenity Sites to ensure proper and appropriate use of resources.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Following the in-depth review of the operations of the Civic Amenity sites, a review of the policies and procedures including internal controls and risk management on the capturing of income , billing and/or collection .

Section C: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Landfill operation and Civic Amenity Sites in 2022. On site visits to the Civic Amenity Sites the following good practices were observed:

- Floats were in order at all locations
- Written procedures are in place
- CAS staff provide a courteous and invaluable service to the community
- Offices, kiosks and sites were tidy and well organised
- There is good segregation of duties - Cash Offices, Municipal District Offices and Environment all have a supporting role

Waste Management in Ireland is governed by EU and National Policy. Each Local Authority must produce a Waste Management Plan containing objectives for prevention and promotion of recycling. In addition, Clare’s Waste Enforcement Unit drafted Bye Laws in 2018. The operation of a Landfill and Civic Amenity Site is an important part of Waste Management.

Funding was received via the Department of Communications, Climate Action & Environment Anti-Dumping Initiative in 2022 for projects such as *Bikes for Ukraine* where people brought unwanted bikes (free) to any CAS, they were subsequently repaired and distributed to Ukrainian refugees living in Clare. There was also a free mattress disposal day and these initiatives raise awareness and lead to increased footfall. There are also WEEE (Waste Electrical & Electronic Equipment) subvention and subsidies under the Packaging Regulations (REPAK) along with fees from collection of clothes, metals and batteries. There are 50 full-time and 4 seasonal bring banks, both within recycling centres and at standalone bottle banks around the county.

Expenditure, Income & Budget

A budget for Recovery & Recycling Facilities Operations is approved by the Council annually and the Agresso Financial Management System is used to record all income and expenditure and is used for monitoring same with an expenditure budget of €2,324,065 in 2022 including operational running costs.

It is important that expenditure is monitored and controlled in order to achieve value for money and to ensure the effective use of resources.

Scale of charges for recycling varies from €5, €9, €12 and €25 depending on the vehicle size. General domestic waste disposal charges start at €7 per bag, with various rates for timber and furniture.

INCOME FOR 2022

	Recycling	Landfill	Total
<i>BDB</i>	€ 70,860	€304,867	€375,727
<i>Ennis</i>	€ 43,574	N/A	€ 43,574
<i>Lisdeen</i>	€ 17,140	€85,282	€102,422
<i>Scariff</i>	€ 29,753	€90,647	€120,400
<i>Shannon</i>	€ 52,872	N/A	€ 52,872
Total	€214,199	€480,796	€694,995

Procedure manuals for each of the Civic Amenity Sites were reviewed and the following

gaps where identified:

- Opening hours for all CAS to be reviewed and procedure manuals and signage at the sites to be compared so as to be consistent with the Council's website
- It would be best practice to use Document Version Control to track changes for each procedure manual

Conclusion

It is the opinion of Internal Audit that Clare County Council is in reasonable compliance with the standards of the Public Spending Code in respect of its responsibilities for the Civic Amenity Sites in 2022.

The budget for the Civic Amenity Sites is included in the overall Annual Budget and is part of the Council's overall budgetary process. The Budget is monitored and managed appropriately.

APPENDIX C

**Details of Projects and Programmes that exceeded
€500,000 during 2022**

Expenditure being Considered - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)

Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Reference)	Expenditure Amount in Reference	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Projected Lifetime Expenditure	Explanatory Notes
Current Expenditure Programme - Increases over €0.5m							
A01 - Maintenance/Improvement of LA Housing Units	Programme increase	€ 567,598.00					
A07 - RAS and Leasing Programme	Programme increase	€ 2,407,461.00					
B04 - Local Road - Maintenance and Improvement	Programme increase	€ 2,721,718.00					
B05 - Public Lighting	Programme increase	€ 524,341.00					
D06 - Community and Enterprise Function	Programme increase	€ 983,296.00					
D09 - Economic Development and Promotion	Programme increase	€ 677,690.00					
E11 - Operation of Fire Service	Programme increase	€ 747,392.00					
F02 - Operation of Library and Archival Service	Programme increase	€ 612,176.00					
Housing & Building							
Market Street, Ennis, 14 units.	Turnkey CALF				2023 - 2024	€ 2,600,000.00	
Ballaghboy, Quin Road, Ennis, 5 houses	Social housing construction - Traveller Accommodation				2023 - 2024	€ 1,054,873.00	
Bruachlan, Westbury, 22 units	Voluntary housing (CAS)				2023 - 2024	€ 1,200,000.00	
Cluain Laoi, Kilkishen, 16 units	Voluntary housing (CALF)				2023 - 2024	€ 2,000,000.00	
Limerick Road Sixmilebridge, 28 units	Voluntary housing (CALF)				2022 - 2024	€ 4,200,000.00	
Clarehill, Clarecastle, 14 houses	Turnkey social housing				2023 - 2024	€ 6,000,000.00	
Gort Road, Ennis, 20 houses	Social Housing construction				2023 - 2024	€ 1,530,000.00	
Kilkee, 12 apartments	Turnkey social housing				2023 - 2024	€ 2,300,000.00	
Acha Bhile, Lahinch Road, 33 units	Voluntary housing (CALF)				2023 - 2024	€ 2,145,000.00	
Roslevan, 25 houses	Voluntary housing (CALF)				2023 - 2024	€ 4,600,000.00	
Loughville, Ennis 48 houses	Voluntary housing (CALF)				2023 - 2024	€ 3,500,000.00	
Kilrush, 41 units (Convent)	Voluntary housing (CALF)				2023 - 2024	€ 6,700,000.00	
Kilkee, 23 units	Social Housing construction				2023 - 2024	€ 900,000.00	
Clarecastle, 3 units	Turnkey social housing				2023 - 2024	€ 2,300,000.00	
Clarecastle 8 apartments	Turnkey social housing				2023 - 2024	€ 2,500,000.00	
Sixmilebridge, 9 units	Turnkey social housing				2023 - 2024	€ 4,000,000.00	
Riverwood, Kilrush, 31 units	Voluntary Housing (CAS) acquisition				2023 - 2024	€ 8,500,000.00	
Kilrush, 22 units	Turnkey social housing				2023 - 2024	€ 600,000.00	
LIHAF Local Infrastructure Housing Activation Fund , Clareen	L.I.H.A.F CLAREEN ENNIS	Urban connector road			2023- 2025	€ 8,600,000.00	
Development Management							
Scariff Town Regeneration Project	Multi service hub & Public Realm				2023 - 2024	€ 4,000,000.00	
East Clare Failte ireland Outdoor Activity Facility	Failte ireland Outdoor Amenity Building	Amenity Building			2022 - 2025	€ 1,200,000.00	
West Clare Failte ireland Outdoor Activity Facility	Failte ireland Outdoor Amenity Building				2023 - 2025	€ 2,270,000.00	
West Clare Remediation project	ACM - Remediation				2022 - 2026	€ 7,500,000.00	
Maritime Education Facility	Maritime Education Zone (MEZ) RRDF				2023 - 2027	€ 9,000,000.00	
Greenway Development	Greenway Development				2023-2025	€ 5,000,000.00	
Recreation & Amenity							
East Clare Tourism Facility Development	Tourism Site Remediation					€ 4,000,000.00	
Cliffs Of Moher Capital Development	Cliffs Of Moher Capital Development				2023 - 2026	€ 5,000,000.00	
Totals		€ 9,241,672.00				€ 103,199,873.00	

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)

Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to-date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)	Explanatory Notes
Housing & Building								
Housing Planned Maintenance Programme	Upgrade of LA stock	€ -		€ 1,111,238.00	2018 - 2028	€ 3,550,331.00	€ 10,000,000.00	Council long term non-mortgage loan funding
Limerick Road, Ennis, 24 units (AHB)	Voluntary housing (CALF)			€ 709,007.00	2022 - 2023	€ 709,007.00	€ 1,770,000.00	
Limerick Road, Ennis, 18 units (AHB)	Voluntary housing (CALF)			€ 518,400.00	2022 - 2023	€ 518,400.00	€ 1,500,000.00	
Saint Senan's Terrace, Kilrush, 5 houses	Buy and renew construction			€ 3,074.00	2022 - 2024	€ 3,074.00	€ 800,000.00	
Maddens Tce, Clarecastle, 2 units	Social housing			€ 10,258.00	2020 - 2023	€ 54,784.00	€ 648,878.00	Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Ballyminogue, Scariff, 18 units	Social housing	€ -		€ 280,190.00	2021 - 2024	€ 440,324.00	€ 4,941,000.00	Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Ennistymon, 30 units	Social housing	€ -		€ 92,787.00	2021 - 2024	€ 99,155.00	€ 7,950,855.00	Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Doonbeg lands, 8 units	Social housing	€ -		€ 10,915.00	2021 - 2024	€ 155,840.00	€ 2,080,000.00	Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Drumcliff Road, 26 units	Social housing	€ -		€ 94,483.00	2021 - 2024	€ 747,308.00	€ 6,280,000.00	Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Ballyliddan West, Sixmilebridge 15 units	Social housing	€ -		€ 252,454.00	2021 - 2024	€ 301,309.00	€ 3,654,000.00	Housing Construction SHIP funded 100%
Road Transportation & Safety								
N19 Shannon airport access road	national road upgrade			€ 412,452.00	2019 - 2024	€ 1,068,503.00	€ 1,500,000.00	TII road realignment funded 100%
Public Lighting Energy Efficiency Project	LED lights changeover		€ 625,738.00		2020 - 2023	€ 692,134.00	€ 5,000,000.00	Council long term non-mortgage loan funding
Flood Relief Scheme Shannon Town and Environs	Flood protection			€ 477,939.00	2019 - 2025	€ 1,511,414.00	€ 2,000,000.00	OPW and Department grant funded 100%
Flood relief scheme South East Clare	Flood protection			€ 293,587.00	2019 - 2023	€ 959,067.00	€ 1,400,000.00	OPW and Department grant funded 100%
Flood Relief scheme West Clare	Flood protection			€ 32,278.00	2019 - 2023	€ 109,415.00	€ 600,000.00	OPW and Department grant funded 100%
Killaloe Bypass & Shannon Bridge Crossing	New bridge, bypass, road upgrade			€ 7,484,070.00	2018 - 2024	€ 28,763,065.00	€ 69,000,000.00	TII road realignment funded 100%
Costal protection West Clare	Coastal Protection			€ 99,757.00	2022 - 2025	€ 99,757.00	€ 1,500,000.00	
Development Management								
Ennis Public Realm Phase 2	URDF Public Realm			€ 499,624.17	2022 - 2024	€ 774,682.86	€ 11,000,000.00	URDF with 25% own resources.
Vandeleur Walled Garden Renovation	Tourism Site Remediation and Upgrade RRDF			€ 1,540,958.00	2020 - 2022	€ 2,157,932.00	€ 2,634,426.00	RRDF with 25% own resources.
Ennistymon Tourism Destination Town Project	Failte ireland Destination Town Public Realm			€ 139,105.00	2020 - 2022	€ 664,865.00	€ 670,000.00	Failte Ireland funding with 25% own resources
Inis Cealtra (Holy Island) Tourism Location phase 1	Tourism Site Remediation and Upgrade RRDF			€ 284,820.00	2020 - 2024	€ 2,540,447.00	€ 6,553,000.00	RRDF with 25% own resources
Recreation & Amenity								
Ennis Library	New library			€ 3,234,999.00	2017 - 2023	€ 7,115,333.80	€ 13,600,000.00	Part grant, part Council non-mortgage loan funded
Land for Economic Development EMD	Land Acquisition		€ 1,174,492.00		2022 - 2023	€ 1,174,492.00	€ 1,174,492.00	
Cliffs Of Moher Strategy Development	Cliffs OF Moher reinvestment		€ -		2020 - 2026	€ 92,493.00	€ 3,000,000.00	
Miscellaneous Services								
Land for Economic Development EMD	Property Acquisition		€ 861,391.00		2022 - 2023	€ 861,391.00	€ 861,391.00	
REVENUE EXPENDITURE								
A02 - Housing Assessment, Allocation and Transfer	Ongoing annual cost	€ 682,201.00						
A03 - Housing Rent and Tenant Purchase Administration	Ongoing annual cost	€ 806,853.00						
A04 - Housing Community Development Support	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,379,028.00						
A05 - Administration of Homeless Service	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,896,793.00						
A06 - Support to Housing Capital Programme	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,424,889.00						
A08 - Housing Loans	Ongoing annual cost	€ 867,618.00						
A09 - Housing Grants	Ongoing annual cost	€ 3,230,054.00						
B02 - NS Road - Maintenance and Improvement	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,688,421.00						
B03 - Regional Road - Maintenance and Improvement	Ongoing annual cost	€ 8,276,436.00						
B07 - Road Safety Engineering Improvement	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,010,905.00						
B09 - Car Parking	Ongoing annual cost	€ 910,916.00						
B10 - Support to Roads Capital Programme	Ongoing annual cost	€ 839,697.00						
C01 - Water Supply	Ongoing annual cost	€ 6,376,714.00						
C02 - Waste Water Treatment	Ongoing annual cost	€ 3,557,280.00						
C05 - Admin of Group and Private Installations	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,690,187.00						
C06 - Support to Water Capital Programme	Ongoing annual cost	€ 622,275.00						
D01 - Forward Planning	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,429,289.00						
D02 - Development Management	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,007,625.00						
D03 - Enforcement	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,131,321.00						
D05 - Tourism Development and Promotion	Ongoing annual cost	€ 11,849,941.00						

D11 - Heritage and Conservation Services	Ongoing annual cost	€ 609,211.00					
E01 - Landfill Operation and Aftercare	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,191,535.00					
E02 - Recovery & Recycling Facilities Operations	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,324,065.00					
E05 - Litter Management	Ongoing annual cost	€ 856,926.00					
E06 - Street Cleaning	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,101,647.00					
E07 - Waste Regulations, Monitoring and Enforcement	Ongoing annual cost	€ 545,386.00					
E09 - Maintenance of Burial Grounds	Ongoing annual cost	€ 678,272.00					
E10 - Safety of Structures and Places	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,101,128.00					
E12- Fire Prevention	Ongoing annual cost	€ 632,566.00					
E13 - Water Quality, Air and Noise Pollution	Ongoing annual cost	€ 691,472.00					
F01 - Leisure Facilities Operations	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,864,768.00					
F03 - Outdoor Leisure Areas Operation	Ongoing annual cost	€ 2,999,985.00					
F04 - Community Sport & Recreational Development	Ongoing annual cost	€ 540,754.00					
F05 - Operation of Arts Programme	Ongoing annual cost	€ 1,796,420.00					
G04 - Veterinary Service	Ongoing annual cost	€ 522,832.00					
H01 - Profit & Loss Machinery Yard	Ongoing annual cost	€ 770,141.00					
H03 - Administration of Rates	Ongoing annual cost	€ 7,769,186.00					
H09 - Local Representation and Civil Leadership	Ongoing annual cost	€ 3,510,130.00					
H10 - Motor Taxation	Ongoing annual cost	€ 978,813.00					
Totals		€ 86,163,680.00	€ 2,661,621.00	€ 17,582,395.17		€ 55,164,523.66	€ 160,118,042.00

Projects/Programmes Completed or discontinued in the reference year - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)

Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Completion Date	Final Outturn Expenditure	Explanatory Notes
Housing & Building							
Vacant stock 2022	Stock upgrade			€ 1,495,816.00	2022	€ 1,495,816.00	partially funded by Department
Energy efficiency phase 2	Stock upgrade	€ -	€ -	€ 1,462,400.00	2022	€ 1,462,400.00	partially funded by Department
DPG Stock 2022	Stock adaptation			€ 733,047.00	2022	€ 733,047.00	90% funded by Department
Turnkey development at Lifford, 61 houses/apartments	Turnkey scheme			€ 18,874,298.00	2022	€ 18,874,298.00	
Mountshannon, 4 houses	Turnkey scheme			€ 607,682.00	2022	€ 607,682.00	
Ashline, Ennis, 40 houses	Social housing	€ -	€ -	€ 3,581,065.00	2022	€ 10,937,648.00	
Ballard Road, Miltown Malbay 27 units	Social housing	€ -	€ -	€ 2,625,117.00	2022	€ 6,610,417.00	
Doonaun, Tulla, 25 units	Social housing	€ -	€ -	€ 2,180,506.00	2022	€ 6,319,662.00	
Boheraroan, Newmarket on Fergus, 18 units	Social housing	€ -	€ -	€ 892,479.00	2022	€ 4,227,475.00	
Shantraud Woods Killaloe, 4 turnkey units	Turnkey scheme	€ -	€ -	€ 924,803.00	2022	€ 1,025,107.00	
Tulla Road, Roslevan, 8 units	Social housing			€ 1,641,521.00	2022	€ 1,802,156.00	
Pairc na Coille, Ennis 4 units	Acquisition			€ 665,490.00	2022	€ 665,490.00	
Roslevan, Tulla Road, 68 units	Voluntary housing (CALF)			€ 3,371,951.00	2022	€ 4,254,176.00	
Road Transportation & Safety							
Ennis South Flood Relief Scheme	Flood protection			€ 67,417.00	2022	€ 18,293,280.00	OPW and Department grant funded 100%
Development Management							
Ennis Public Realm Regen Phase 1	Streetscape project			€ 119,008.00	2022	€ 5,451,472.00	
Miscellaneous Services							
Land or Buildings for Economic Development EMD	Property acquisition	€ -		€ 45,099.00	2022	€ 939,396.00	
Totals				€ 39,287,699.00		€ 83,699,522.00	

